

Lindenwood University

Digital Commons@Lindenwood University

Theses

Theses & Dissertations

5-2024

Revealing the Similarities Between Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights and Medieval Musical Forms

Lindsay A. Nevin

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.lindenwood.edu/theses>



Part of the [History of Art, Architecture, and Archaeology Commons](#)

REVEALING THE SIMILARITIES BETWEEN BOSCH'S GARDEN OF
EARTHLY DELIGHTS AND MEDIEVAL MUSICAL FORMS

A Thesis Submitted to the Faculty of the (Insert Department Here)

Degree of Master's in Fine Arts

at

Lindenwood University

By

Lindsay A. Nevin

Saint Charles, Missouri

May 2024

ABSTRACT**REVEALING THE SIMILARITIES BETWEEN BOSCH'S GARDEN OF EARTHLY
DELIGHTS AND MEDEIVAL MUSICAL FORMS**

Lindsay Nevin, Master of Art History and Visual Culture, 2024

Thesis Directed by: Dr. James Hutson PhD

This paper analyzes the triptych entitled *The Garden of Earthly Delights* by Hieronymus Bosch painted between 1490 and 1510. This specific piece is Bosch's most famous and therefore garners the largest amount of discourse analyzing the visual components of it. This specific paper is unique in its approach by using methodology similar to music historians to relate the forms of music popular at this time to the visual elements in the work. Some of the most popular music genres at the time were those of madrigal and polyphonic. An additional element popular in the transition between the 15th and 16th century is dissonance. All of these elements are examples of form that can be applied to both music and the visual arts. Analyzing *The Garden of Earthly Delights* with these forms not only highlights the relationship between art and music but also gives insight into the ideals and opinions of the patron of the work as well as the artist. It is necessary when approaching this work through the lens of music history to understand the references that Bosch makes, as well as how to interpret those signified. The aim of this paper is to employ the analytic methods used in both art and music history in order to interpret *The Garden of Earthly Delights* and produce a unique piece of scholarship that provides an in-depth example of how music influenced the visual practices and iconographies of the Northern Renaissance.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. LIST OF FIGURES.....	iv
2. INTRODUCTION.....	1
3. LITERATURE REVIEW.....	11
4. METHODOLOGY.....	44
5. ANALYSIS.....	49
6. CONCLUSION.....	60
7. FIGURES.....	64
8. RESOURCES.....	68

List of Figures

- Figure 1, Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights*. 1450-1516. Oil on oak. 205.5 x 384.9 cm. Museo del Prado, Madrid.....64
- Figure 2, Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights Triptych* (closed). Oil on oak. 220 x 196 cm. Museo del Prado, Madrid.....64
- Figure 3, Jan Van Eyck, *Crucifixion and Last Judgement* diptych, oil on canvas transferred from wood. 56.5 x 19.7 cm. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.....65
- Figure 4, Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights* (detail).....65
- Figure 5, Robert Campin. *Portrait of a Woman*, oil and egg tempera on panel, 1435, 40 x 27 cm. National Gallery, London.....66
- Figure 6, Giulio Quaglio the Younger, Ceiling in Ljublijana Cathedral, frescoe on plaster, 1703-1706, photographed by Petar Milosevic, 2015. Slovenia.....66
- Figure 7, Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights* (detail).....67

Introduction/ Background Information

The Middle Ages, consisting of the years 500-1500 CE, includes a period described as the Northern Renaissance. This period is not to be confused with the Italian Renaissance happening simultaneously that differs both geographically and stylistically. The Northern Renaissance physically takes place north of the mountain range known as the Alps, and features works from Germany, England, and The Netherlands. The late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries brought forth a large array of new ideals, including humanism, science, and the normalization of art and music in both domestic and public settings.

Before the Northern Renaissance, devotional art featured symbols and allegories alluding to the Old Testament.¹ One may read this as a simple definition of the term non-secular. What makes Northern Renaissance art unique is the humanist aspect or treatment of the figures in the work. Emotional iconography that depicts truthful mental states becomes an approach during the Renaissance as a part of the humanist movement, emphasizing the human existence as opposed to the divine.² The artist Jan Van Eyck is often cited as leading the popularization of verisimilitude, or the appearance of truth.³ Specific to this cultural period, non-secular humanism focused on the humanity of Jesus, a shift away from viewing Him, or Christ, as

¹ Anita Strezova, "General Iconographic Changes in the 14th and 15th Centuries," in *Hesychasm and Art: The Appearance of New Iconographic Trends in Byzantine and Slavic Lands in the 14th and 15th Centuries* (Canberra: ANU Press, 2014): 63.

² IBID, 65.

³ Linda Seidel, "The Value of Verisimilitude in the Art of Jan Van Eyck." *Yale French Studies*, (1991).

divine. This concept was widespread throughout various mediums, including writing with elegance and clarity of style and form being terms assigned to humanist literary authors.⁴ Within the context of art, this meant that in a more general sense, artists shifted from being craftsmen to educated individuals that occasionally sought to ask and then answer questions through their work. The newly created emphasis on intellect plays a significant role in the concept of mannerism as well.

During the Italian Renaissance, “the style” of *maniera* was developed in Italy, accompanied by the belief that excellence in the visual arts required criteria that emphasized the artist’s intellect. This same concept is mentioned in a discussion of music by author James Haar, saying, “the creation of manneristic rhetoric in music has been seen as the result of the attempts to give greater verisimilitude and greater expressiveness to settings of madrigalian verse.”⁵ In addition to this, musicians of the time were often accompanied by portraits of themselves in order to give listeners a better understanding of the personality behind the creator.⁶ Music played a massive role in life during both the Italian and the Northern Renaissances. The ways in which

⁴ Willem Elders, “Humanism and Early-Renaissance Music: A Study of the Ceremonial Music by Ciconia and Dufay,” *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging Voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 27, no. 2 (1977): 71.

⁵ James Haar, “Classicism and Mannerism in 16th-Century Music,” *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1994): 11.

⁶ Willem Elders, “Humanism and Early-Renaissance Music: A Study of the Ceremonial Music by Ciconia and Dufay,” *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging Voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 27, no. 2 (1977): 73.

the music of this era is described can seamlessly be applied to the visual arts, and there are instances when the same phrases are utilized to do so.

Up until the Northern Renaissance, monophonic chants dominated the medieval period, featured in the music and lyrics of the troubadours. Troubadours led a wandering life, consorting with the upper classes and writing poems to be sung most often about courtly love.⁷ Those who could not sing employed “joglars” to carry out the task for them, and by the time Henry V ruled, the upper classes did not differentiate themselves from these poets and are cited as dining and dancing all together.⁸ The instruments often accompanying the vocalists include the lute, viol de gamba, harp, tabor, sackbut, organistrum, and bagpipes. This group of artists earned a valuable position within the culture of the Middle Ages, with Dante putting a recalcitrant troubadour into one of the lowest hells in his *Inferno*.⁹ In the north, the same cult of the troubadour was practiced, but the subject matter of the poems slightly differed, with themes of epic romances as opposed to simply love. Author Hugo Leichtentritt writes in his article on the subject that the music from specifically Northern Europe was so overpowering, that the Italian Renaissance of music was completely delayed and did not have its own identity until the end of the 16th century.¹⁰ The singing of men and women within the courts was regarded highly and did not carry a stigma. For the Church up until the 13th century, the church dramas, or libretto, consisted of a single vocal line with no accompanying evidence of instrumental accompaniment, or even

⁷ C.J. Tabor, “The Troubadours,” *Folklore* 40, no. 4 (1929): 346.

⁸ IBID, 350.

⁹ IBID, 346.

¹⁰ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude towards Music.” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 604.

harmony.¹¹ Preferential treatment towards single line music meant that the presence of jongleurs in a liturgical ceremony was looked upon with complete disfavor.¹² A possible reasoning for this prejudice against secular instruments is accredited to their associations with the Pagan world, especially with that of the Roman theatre.¹³ Church Fathers, however, hit a possible snag with the presence of instruments in many of the Medieval Psalters. To circumvent this, the devotional leaders instead opted to interpret the instruments symbolically, or allegorically, as opposed to reading these specific inclusions as historical renderings.¹⁴ Like with any religion, this practice had exceptions, in this case exemplified by the exegetical school of the Antioch, who did advocate for a more literal and historical interpretation of the Old Testament.¹⁵ Despite this more liberal example, they too believed secular instruments to be the accessories of sin but instead blamed it on the Jews as having forced God to tolerate these tools.¹⁶ This opinion, however, changed as the shift between the later Middle Ages and the beginning of the Renaissance occurred, with a larger portion of instruments reported in the 15th century.¹⁷

¹¹ W.L. Smoldon, "Medieval Church Drama and the Use of Musical Instruments," *The Musical Times* 103, no. 1438 (1962): 836.

¹² IBID, 837.

¹³ IBID.

¹⁴ James W. Mckinnon, "Musical Instruments in Medieval Psalm Commentaries and Psalters." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 21, no. 1 (1968): 4.

¹⁵ IBID, 13.

¹⁶ IBID, 8.

¹⁷ W.L. Smoldon, "Medieval Church Drama and the Use of Musical Instruments," *The Musical Times* 103, no. 1438 (1962): 837.

As popular music shifted from monophonic to polyphonic chants, the madrigal emerged as one of the most frequently practiced. This form existed in both the Italian and Northern Renaissances but began in Italy as mainly written for solo voices, with Dutch polyphony later influencing it to add more than one line.¹⁸ In the Middle Ages, this type of music would have been performed for masses within a devotional setting, with its connotation turning secular by the time the Renaissance occurs. The use of multiple music notes at once encouraged the implementation of large ensemble groups and previously cited as instruments that could keep up with the blending of multiple notes at once.¹⁹ However, it is important to note that when looking at old sheet music, if there are multiple melodies happening concurrently, it is more likely that one line is dedicated to a vocalist, whereas the rest are assigned to musical instruments in accompaniment.²⁰ The earlier chansons of the Middle Ages performed by the troubadours contained subject matters of courtly love comprised of one vocalist and an instrument, whereas the madrigals were sung secularly in groups of three or four without instrumental accompaniment.

Within the music of this period, there are several important formal characteristics that occur. The musicians of the Netherlands and the first Dutch school are accredited with developing harmony in its modern definition, creating a euphony in the combination of several

¹⁸ Hugo Leichtentritt, "The Renaissance Attitude Towards Music," *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 620.

¹⁹ Jeremy Montagu, "Renaissance instruments". *The Oxford Companion to Music*, edited by Alison Latham. Oxford Music Online. Retrieved 1/28/2024.

²⁰ Hugo Leichtentritt, "The Renaissance Attitude Towards Music," *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 608.

parts.²¹ Despite its popularity in the north, this sentiment of balance between all parts of the composition is cited as being a characteristically Italian trait, making the Dutch schools practice an easy sell for the southern musicians.²² The High Renaissance in music is accredited the characteristics of smoothly jointed counterpoints in which dissonance is carefully regulated, and structures are equal with clear points of articulation and plenty of light and air suffusing the texture.²³ With the popularity of harmonies within balanced compositions, a series of experimental compositions occurred as the Renaissance developed. An example of this can be found in the music of 16th century composer Claudio Monteverdi, whose music is described as being, “full of daring harmonic innovations surprising even for our time, powerful, striking modulations, sudden transitions into distant keys,” by historian Hugo Leichtentritt.²⁴ Innovations in sudden transitions were embodied by the *intermezzi* or dramatic scenes inserted in between acts of plays in which a lively musical skit occurred that did not necessarily have anything to do with the rest of the performance.²⁵ Despite harmony being a strong presence in the music of the Renaissance, the nature of polyphonic music allowed for occasional overlapping of notes, creating disharmony.

²¹ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude Towards Music,” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 609.

²² IBID, 612.

²³ James Haar, “Classicism and Mannerism in 16th-Century Music,” *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. ½ (1994): 8.

²⁴ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude Towards Music,” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 615.

²⁵ IBID, 620.

Within a sheet of madrigal music, dissonant phrase overlapping is created when one or more lines introduce pitches that do not fit within the main harmonies of the melody. Within madrigal music in general, there is a prioritization of overlapping phrases as to limit pauses.²⁶ Sometimes, when a new phrase is entering, the notes fit within the main harmonies of the song. But there is also a theme within this music of changing the melody from one phrase to the next without these harmonies. In modern music, one identifies this as a key change, which happens quite often without much attention being paid. But because these phrases overlap due to the nature of the madrigal, the two different keys are stacked on top of one another, leaving a moment of dissonance, until the previous phrase ends and the new one continues, resolving the dissonance. The overall piece has a series of visual components piled on top of one another, creating a constant stimulation in the viewer's mind.

Before the Renaissance, music was practiced in both secular and non-secular settings. Within a non-secular or devotional context, it was believed that choral groups singing on earth were the translators for the angels singing in heaven, the same way a wafer represents the Heavenly Body of Christ.²⁷ The humanism that arose with the Renaissance continues this emphasis on Christianity but relates Jesus more to humanity than to divinity. Despite this shift, the relationship between music and art is shown even more effectively by comparing a triptych, a religious altarpiece, to the music of the Northern Renaissance. The two, despite being within separate fields, share formal components and themes that open up the reading of each to be more

²⁶ John Turci-Escobar, "Keeping Up with the Words: Expressive Phrase Overlapping in the Late Italian Madrigal," *Music Analysis* 30, no. 2/3 (July-October 2011): 165.

²⁷ Oliver Huck, "The Music of the Angels in Fourteenth- and Early Fifteenth-Century Music," *Musica Disciplina* 53 (2003): 101.

extensive and successful, as one can use elements from one as a key code for the other. As described by John-Turci Escobar in his text on madrigal music, there are a few primary text-expressive methods within this music.²⁸ These methods can be taken from this field and be applied to the art works of the same time.

Jeroen van Aken, otherwise known as Hieronymus Bosch, was born in 's-Hertogenbosch, Netherlands, growing to be one of the most famous artists from the art period in discussion. Despite the artist's widespread fame, there is little known about the Dutchman. Because of this, most historians add a disclaimer to their discourse that any attempt to decipher hidden meanings in his work must be labeled as based on conjecture.²⁹ The lack of information about Bosch's life makes it necessary to understand the life of an artist in 's-Hertogenbosch, based on his wealth class and the cultural activities that accompany that. A large portion of what is known about Bosch's career as a painter is due to surviving records kept by the Brotherhood of Our Lady, a secret religious confraternity comprised of well-to-do men dedicated to the Virgin Mary.³⁰ Bosch's involvement with a religious confraternity not only alludes to his status as an upper-class man, but also hints at his devotional nature. The vices condemned by Bosch include those similar to those condemned by most Christian devotees: giving way to bodily impulses,

²⁸ John Turci-Escobar, "Keeping Up with the Words: Expressive Phrase Overlapping in the Late Italian Madrigal," *Music Analysis* 30, no. 2/3 (July-October 2011): 156

²⁹ Laurinda S. Dixon, "Bosch's Garden of Delights Triptych: Remnants of a Fossil Science," *The Art Bulletin* 63, no. 1 (1981): 96.

³⁰ Pilar Silva Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition* (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado, 2016): 39.

aggression, excess consumption of food and drink, and sex above all.³¹ Having the knowledge that the artist disapproved of these activities is necessary when viewing his art within a cultural context, including festivals filled with large feasts and music enjoyed by the court circles.³²

This paper will discuss Hieronymus's work titled *Garden of Earthly Delights* through a historical contextual lens of music and musicologists. Bosch is cited as using folk customs of 's-Hertogenbosch in order to relate a traditionally non-secular subject matter to his own experience with certain practices and customs he deemed sinful.³³ In order to do this, it will be necessary to look at other forms of media popular at the time that use the same forms such as humanism, mannerism, and the musicological modes, such as dissonance, word painting, and patterns within notations. A visual analysis of Bosch's *The Garden of Earthly Delights* shows style in practice, using figures pulled from the Bible in a humanistic way. In addition to this, the famous triptych utilizes several expressive phrases overlapping and embodies the harmonious chaos of the Northern Renaissance. Readings of this work when the triptych is fully opened in a cultural context highlights the various musical cultural practices that Bosch is said to have looked down upon as sin during his lifetime. This specific work of art has already garnered a plethora of discourse discussing the possible meanings aimed to be portrayed by the artist. It is through the lens of music history and musicology that this work will provide a unique set of scholarship new to this discourse.

³¹ Pilar Silva Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition* (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado, 2016): 99.

³² IBID, 33.

³³ IBID, 107.

This text will aim to use a mix of formalistic, historiographic, and iconographic approaches to analyzing each of these visual and sonic works. A formal analysis of Bosch's *Garden of Earthly Delights* is necessary to understand this relationship, but this will be done in a musicological way, as opposed to one traditional to art history. There will be a portion of scholarship dedicated to that which has already been said on the topic, as well as the personal contentions of this author. The first of these is that conducting a musicological formal analysis of Bosch's *Garden of Earthly Delights* provides unique findings that reveal the technical similarities between music and art of the Northern Renaissance.

Literature Review

Before going into the discussion on the scholarship that exists surrounding the Northern Renaissance, it is important to this text to refer to a quote by Othmar Luscinius that goes:

And how strange that we find in matters of music a situation entirely different from that of the general state of the arts and letters: in the latter whatever comes closest to venerable antiquity receives most praise; in music, he who does not excel the past becomes the laughingstock of all.³⁴

The laughing referred to in this quotation is caused by the contested idea that music should be accredited with the same praise and attention as the visual arts. The Northern Renaissance is one of the most researched and discussed topics in the field of art history. The scholarship on this era is vast, making it exhilarating for an art historian to sort through. The popularity of music in the transition between the 15th and 16th centuries has given way to some research on this topic, but not the overwhelming amount that has been applied to the visual arts. The goal of this review is to provide a summarization not only of discourse on Bosch and his work but that on music of the Northern Renaissance as well. Within this field, the majority of the discourse on Renaissance art was written centuries after the period occurred. This delay in scholarship is accredited, by historian Jacques Bos, to the sack of Rome in 1527 by German emperor Charles V.³⁵ Despite

³⁴ Luscinius, in Owens, "Music Historiography and the Definition of 'Renaissance,'" *Notes* 47, no. 2 (1990): 307.

³⁵ Jacques Bos, "Framing a New Mode of Historical Experience.: The Renaissance Historiography of Machiavelli and Guicciardini," In *the Making of the Humanities: Volume 1- Early Modern Europe* (Amsterdam University Press, 2010): 351.

this, there still do remain accreditation to contemporary sources found through writings and lyrics of the time that will be cited.

To summarize the scholarship on Hieronymus Bosch in a concise manner is, for the historian, perceivably impossible. This is further made difficult when the topic of the artist himself is being discussed. There is a lack of discourse on the artist's life itself, with a few existing consistencies amongst historians in their descriptions or introductions. One of the more important consistencies is the social status of Bosch. Citing external material signs, author Bruno Blondé maintains that the artist's ownership of a stone house on the marketplace, as well as his inheritance from an elderly wife, place him amongst the higher classes.³⁶ This author also provides tax charts contemporary to Bosch that place him in the wealthiest class from at least 1502 to 1503.³⁷ In addition to this, Pilar Silva Maroto, as a part of an exhibition on the life of Bosch, accredits everything we know about the artist's career as coming from surviving accounts kept by the Brotherhood of Our Lady, an organization made up of wealthy educated men.³⁸ Knowing the wealth of Bosch is important to historians because it may clue one in as to the educational or historical knowledge the artist may have had. This can then be taken to analyze the purpose or meaning behind his works, another heavily discussed topic, especially regarding his aim with the early 16th century *Garden of Earthly Delights*.

³⁶ Bruno Blondé, and Hans Vlieghe, "The Social Status of Hieronymus Bosch," *The Burlington Magazine* 131, no. 1039 (1989): 699.

³⁷ IBID, 700.

³⁸ Pilar Silva Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition* (Thames and Hudson, Miuseo Del Prado, 2016): 39.

There exists a consensus, reiterated by historian Rebekah Rhodes, that the information regarding the work of Bosch, as well as his patrons, are essentially lacking, making it difficult to pinpoint the dates accredited to the paintings creation.³⁹ Bruno Blondé adds to this, saying that it is only in recent times, as of 1989, that Bosch's works have been interpreted against the cultural and socio-economic background of the Netherlands of the estimated period in which he lived.⁴⁰ The earliest surviving description of the *Garden of Earthly Delights* is provided by the travel diary of Antonio de Beatis in 1517. Upon visiting Brussels and the palace of Henry III of Nassau, the entry describes a triptych with 'seas, skies, woods and field with many other things,' including "men and women, both white and black in various actions and positions."⁴¹ This diary from Beatis also provides one of the main arguments as to the patronage of the work. It is mentioned by several historians that the patron most likely to have commissioned this work is Henry III of Nassau. Apart from the documentation from the Brotherhood of Our Blessed Lady, Maroto cites the images used as having noble and courtly associations as exposing that the intended audience is the court of the Nassaus.⁴²

³⁹ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch." *Magazén 4*, no. 2 (2023): 329.

⁴⁰ Bruno Blondé, and Hans Vlieghe, "The Social Status of Hieronymus Bosch," *The Burlington Magazine 131*, no. 1039 (1989): 699.

⁴¹ E.H. Gombrich, "The Earliest Description of Bosch's Garden of Delight." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes 30* (1967): 403.

⁴² Pilar Silva Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition* (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado, 2016): 143.

The meanings behind this artist's work are constantly suggested and contested, with author Peter Glum describing these interpretations of *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, "especially that of the center panel," as remaining, "controversial and elusive."⁴³ It is the focus on the center panel that leads to the exclusion of discourse on the outside of the triptych. When closed, viewers see a translucent sphere with a small figure in the clouds holding a book. This is often argued, as exemplified by Gerta Moray, that it is a depiction of God and the Creation.⁴⁴ In his 1969 reading of the work, E. H. Gombrich assigns the role of God to this figure as well, but instead saying that He is pointing at the pages of a book, as if he were speaking of the covenant.⁴⁵ This specific act of pointing towards the book outlines Gombrich's entire argument as to the meaning of the contents of the panels within the triptych, one that is not of the Last Judgement but of Earth before the Flood and the outside the aftermath.⁴⁶ Agreeing with Gombrich's argument would make the inner panels an illustration of the actual scenes that occurred and prompted God to destroy the world, including the love-making and greed.⁴⁷ The work of Reuterswald's cites the triptych as garnering inspiration from the Bible as well, with the left panel being the Garden of Eden before the Fall, and right panel as purgatory, and the central

⁴³ Peter Glum, "Divine Judgment in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 45.

⁴⁴ Gerta Moray, "Miro, Bosch, and Fantasy Paintings," *The Burlington Magazine* 113, no. 820 (1971): 387.

⁴⁵ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 163.

⁴⁶ IBID.

⁴⁷ IBID.

panel as showing a restored life that possibly comes after the two outer panels chronologically.⁴⁸ The theme that the central panel is depicting life before damnation is shared between both Reutersward and Gombrich. The latter cites the central panel as being the direct causation for God to destroy the world with the Flood, describing the work as depicting actual events.⁴⁹ The former, however, describes the central panel as being a hypothetical, in which those can achieve after damnation if they are to effectively repent.⁵⁰ Another difference between the two is how this central panel is described, with Gombrich describing it as emphasizing wickedness and greed of man, and Reutersward describing it as primeval innocence or guiltlessness of man.⁵¹ The two differentiate with the wickedness and greediness of man as causing disaster, whereas a positive connotation is given with the suggested promise of primeval innocence and guiltlessness. Despite the differences between these approaches, Gombrich concludes his text by warning against non-Biblical readings of the work, the kinds that focus on using historical

⁴⁸ Partik Reuterswald, "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 638.

⁴⁹ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 163.

⁵⁰ Partik Reuterswald, "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 638.

⁵¹ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 163; Partik Reuterswald, "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 638.

contextual clues found within Middle Ages Dutch lore.⁵² It is a combination of the Last Judgement and the contextual lore that has dominated the discourse on this painting.

Beginning with one of the major understandings of this work amongst historians is that the inner panels represent a version of The Last Judgement in which God assigns souls to Heaven or Hell. A recent reading of the work by Rhodes touches on this topic by suggesting that the right panel on the inside of the triptych represents Hell and all the manners of punishments that accompany the territory.⁵³ Works depicting this same subject matter are used to argue this sentiment by focusing on the formal similarities.⁵⁴ As previously mentioned, author Patrik Reuterswald reiterates this by describing the two inner panels flanking the center are to be interpreted as two entries into the realm of the main panel, with the left being the Garden of Eden and the right a spiritual purgatory that sinners must experience in order to regain entry into the central panel.⁵⁵ Peter Glum adds to the list of those agreeing to this reading by saying that the composition of the central panel flanked by wings representing Paradise and Hell indicate an

⁵² E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 167.

⁵³ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch," *Magazén* 4, no. 2 (2023): 332.

⁵⁴ Peter Glum, "Divine Judgment in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 47.

⁵⁵ Patrik Reuterswald, "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 638.

imminent judgement to occur in the central panel.⁵⁶ As a part of Maroto's exhibition, author Reindert Falkenburg describes the opening of the triptych as leading the viewer to face a composition that is a subdivision of a paradisiacal landscape on the left and infernal scenery on the right, recalling of late medieval representations of the Last Judgement.⁵⁷

Despite this suggestion that the work is a representation of the Last Judgement, it is also argued by Glum that Bosch used elements of popular Dutch culture to place recognizable meaning to viewers, resulting in a contextualization for historians and scholars.⁵⁸ The viewers in question, however, may spark some debate and determine the meanings. In an article by author Bruno Blondé, the social background of Bosch is discussed, placing him among the wealthy and Bourgeoisie.⁵⁹ It is important to know this when approaching the work because the popular culture of a group could differ greatly between levels of wealth amongst the population. The artist is also cited as featuring recognizable historical events, such as the rivalry between France and the Dukes of Burgundy as exemplified by riders bearing porcupine standards.⁶⁰ Rhodes

⁵⁶ Peter Glum, "Divine Judgment in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 47.

⁵⁷ Reindert Falkenburg in Pilar Silva Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition* (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado. 2016): 136.

⁵⁸ Peter Glum, "Divine Judgment in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 49.

⁵⁹ Bruno Blondé, and Hans Vlieghe, "The Social Status of Hieronymus Bosch," *The Burlington Magazine* 131, no. 1039 (1989): 699.

⁶⁰ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch." *Magazén* 4, no. 2 (2023): 346.

makes the argument that the inclusion of historical events makes the work an interactive allegory in which the patron is encouraged to address their own relationship with global events.⁶¹ Another presence in this work alluding to historical beliefs is that of the wild forest people. As discussed by Patrik Reutersward, there was a subdued view of the wild forest people during the 15th century and later. The author cites the presence of black figures in the triptych, describing them as a symbol for the primitive values lived out by wild forest people. Reutersward uses this argument to encourage viewers to infer that Bosch wished to remind his audience of the existence of these peoples in general.⁶² Having the knowledge of the context of the viewers is crucial because it may hint at Bosch's goal of the work. Not only is he encouraging his audience to address their relationship with global events, but he is also more specifically asking those of the upper classes to contemplate their relationship with global events.

This contextualization is one of the main premises of Laurinda Dixon's scholarship on this work. This text stands out from the other discourse by its approach using the medieval practice of alchemy, citing this practice as being popular and well-known to Bosch.⁶³ Dixon's work is not the first time this topic of alchemy has been mentioned, with Gombrich also

⁶¹ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch." *Magazén 4*, no. 2 (2023): 346.

⁶² Patrik Reutersward, "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 637.

⁶³ Laurinda S Dixon, "Bosch's Garden of Delights Triptych: Remnants of a 'Fossil' Science." *The Art Bulletin* 63, no. 1 (1981): 96.

mentioning the presence of these symbolic codes in a 1969 text.⁶⁴ Unfortunately, the mention of alchemy is as far as Gombrich goes before making an argument as to a biblical meaning for the work. Dixon, however, encourages readers to “shed any modern notions about alchemy and look at the science objectively from a 15th-century point of view, in order to make a serious argument for its relationship to Bosch’s works.”⁶⁵ Dixon’s work is important to this field because it gives an alternate reading of the work that is not biblical. Various authors since have cited this work, agreeing with the arguments with historian Patrik Reutersward championing Dixon’s emphasis on alchemy in a broad sense as a path towards salvation.⁶⁶ She does not disregard the reading of other scholars but adds to it with an effective analysis of the work that explains those that cannot be found within biblical contexts. One of the most important statements made by this work states, “the subject matter and organization of the Garden of Delights triptych is identical to the alchemical allegory which sees distillation as the cyclical creation, destruction, and rebirth of the world and its inhabitants.”⁶⁷ This speaks not only to the images within the triptych, but the form overall and the image of the orb that is featured on the outer panels of the piece when the triptych is physically closed. This form is also mentioned in Gombrich’s work, who agrees that the

⁶⁴ E.H. Gombrich, “Bosch’s Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report,” *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 162.

⁶⁵ Laurinda S Dixon, “Bosch’s Garden of Delights Triptych: Remnants of a ‘Fossil’ Science.” *The Art Bulletin* 63, no. 1 (1981): 97.

⁶⁶ Reutersward, Patrik, “A New Clue to Bosch’s Garden of Delights.” *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 636-638.

⁶⁷ Laurinda S Dixon, “Bosch’s Garden of Delights Triptych: Remnants of a ‘Fossil’ Science.” *The Art Bulletin* 63, no. 1 (1981): 99.

outside of the triptych does depict the Earth as if God were looking down on it but continues with a non-secular argument, leaning on Biblical references as the main inspiration.⁶⁸

The relationship between sex, the Bible, and the objects referring to these is another common point amongst scholars within the discussion of this painting. Some of the scenes in Bosch's worked have been linked to erotic games played at medieval courts that would have been recognizable to the public or the intended courtly viewer.⁶⁹ The relationship between sex and motifs is present in more than just the scholarship on Bosch. In a series of texts on folklore motifs in late medieval art, Malcolm Jones discusses the erotic animal imagery and its accompanying folklore. Some references of note include the gates of hell being compared to the doorway to a bed chamber, where lovers are drawn in by the deadly sin of lust.⁷⁰ In addition to this, Jones references the excavation of a lead amulet in the form of two halves of a mussel shell with an incision of a vulva on the inside, making references to *The Garden of Earthly Delights* as featuring the same shell in the central panel.⁷¹

This discourse also features a reading by Gerta Moray, who states the work shows, "a man in intimate relation to the world of nature, a world also peopled by monsters and fantastic

⁶⁸ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 167.

⁶⁹ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch," *Magazén* 4, no. 2 (2023): 338.

⁷⁰ Malcolm Jones, "Folklore Motifs in Late Medieval Art III: Erotic Animal Imagery," *Folklore* 102, no. 2 (1991): 199.

⁷¹ IBID, 201.

plant forms which seem a concrete projection of human dream and fantasy.⁷² It is interesting to define this man that Moray speaks of. If it is Christ to which he refers, this furthers the humanism of the work by describing Christ as a man on earth but that is separate from the other fantastical beings, Christ is, therefore, related to the other commoners portrayed. Moray's text features an iconographic analysis of Bosch's *Garden of Earthly Delights* in order to relate this work to a more contemporary piece by Miro that exhibits similar elements. Of the motifs that Moray discusses, the majority are from biblical references, arguing that these symbols highlight a meaning concerned with human destiny.⁷³ The previous reading mentioned by Gombrich speaks on this. In his 1969 text, the work is argued as being a representation of the Earth after the Flood that is cited in the Bible. Gombrich makes the claim that in the triptych, God is pointing at the pages of a book as if he were speaking of the covenant, leading to the solution that the work is not a depiction of the Creation.⁷⁴ Instead, Gombrich believes the outer panels of the piece depict the Earth after the Flood, accompanied by life before the flood within the central panel on the inside.⁷⁵ Gombrich also states his belief that the title of the work should be changed to "the lesson of the flood," in order to finalize this argument for future historians.⁷⁶

⁷² Gerta Moray, "Miró, Bosch and Fantasy Painting." *The Burlington Magazine* 113, no. 820 (1971): 388.

⁷³ IBID.

⁷⁴ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's *Garden of Earthly Delights*: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 163.

⁷⁵ IBID.

⁷⁶ IBID, 170.

The presentation of various sources above creates a solid foundation to understanding not only Bosch but *The Garden of Earthly Delights* as well. Despite this, as Paul Barolsky states in his text, “just as a work of art is never finished, so too is its interpretation inevitably incomplete.”⁷⁷ This incomplete interpretation is a common disclaimer amongst almost every author that this paper mentions. The author also describes a work of Botticelli as being similar to the work of Chopin; “as the pianist performs a work of music, doing so artfully both by reading the score and by rendering it expressively, indeed idiosyncratically, so the interpreter who describes the painting itself performs the work of art, doing do with a verbal artifice.”⁷⁸ This relationship is also described by author Alexis Ruccius, saying, “with the introduction of iconography and iconology into the discipline, the connection between musicology and art history became firmly established.”⁷⁹ Ruccius, in this quotation, furthers the argument that the same key for iconographic meanings can be used for both the music and visual arts of a particular historical period. Described as one of the first major music-iconographical works, Hammerstein’s 1974 book *Diabolus in Musica* entails an analysis of the *Musician’s Hell* by Bosch.⁸⁰ The Hell to which Hammerstein speaks of is the right panel of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* Triptych. The harp in this panel is enlarged and stuck into the side of a naked man. At

⁷⁷ Paul Barolsky “The Interpretation of Art is Never Finished: Some Renaissance Examples,” *Arlon: A Journal of Humanities and the Classics* Vol. 23, No. 2 (Fall 2015): 198.

⁷⁸ IBID, 205.

⁷⁹ Alexis Ruccius “The History of Musical Iconography and the Influence of Art History: Pictures as Sources and Interpreters of Musical History.” In *The Making of the Humanities: Volume III: The Modern Humanities*, 403–12. Amsterdam University Press, 2014): 403.

⁸⁰ IBID, 408.

the time, the harp was considered a heavenly instrument; Hammerstein makes the claim that Bosch misappropriating the harp as a form of torture is the artist's way of calling for penitence in a time dominated by arousal and skepticism.⁸¹ This not only shows an example of how music iconography can be helpful within art historical readings, but it can be suggested that Bosch would agree. The inclusion of these instruments would be useless to the viewer if there was not a cultural understanding of their meaning outside of the work.

An interesting argument that stands somewhat alone amongst this discourse, written by Esther Mulders, discusses The Garden of Pleasure as a part of the famous poem of the time, *The Romance of the Rose*. The Garden of Pleasure to which Mulders discusses is a paradise of sweetness, as well as a place of tortuous arrows, thorns and despair that all increase the lover's burning desire.⁸² This poem is interesting to include in this discussion because it features a lot of the same characteristics as Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights. Mulders described a wall covered with images of personifications of evil and uncourtly human qualities, such as avarice, sadness, old age, hypocrisy, and so on.⁸³ What is most interesting about this research, however, is how, in the poem, the God of Love turns this heavenly garden into one of torment using all of the same components that were previously objects of ecstasy. The main example highlighted by Mulders is that this God turns a rose, the objects of the narrator's desire, into a source of

⁸¹ Alexis Ruccius "The History of Musical Iconography and the Influence of Art History: Pictures as Sources and Interpreters of Musical History." In *The Making of the Humanities: Volume III: The Modern Humanities*, 403–12. Amsterdam University Press, 2014): 408.

⁸² Esther Mulders, *The Green Middle Ages: The Depiction and Use of Plants in the Western World 600-1600* (Amsterdam University Press, 2022): 237.

⁸³ IBID, 233.

distress.⁸⁴ Within Bosch's work, this same act of turning objects of desire and joy into those of torment is also present. Rhodes mentions this when describing the punishments in Hell, or the right panel of the triptych. The panel features characters tortured on giant musical instruments that are assumed to be used in the central panel as a source of joy, or in Bosch's mind, sin.⁸⁵ Gombrich also mentions this theme, discussing how the eating, drinking, marrying, and giving in marriage turns from instruments of pleasure to tools of torture.⁸⁶ Despite the varying examples from historians, the same conclusion can be made with regards to this sub-theme of Bosch, in which tools of pleasure are turned into those of torture.

When it comes to discourse about the history of music, it is interesting how historians choose to word their findings. Jessie Ann Owens separates the types of musical historiographers into two groups: Italians, and *oltramontani*, or Germans.⁸⁷ In addition to this separation, Owens also points out that, "most of the writers value music of the present more highly than that of the past."⁸⁸ One of the major differences between the descriptions of polyphonic music and Northern Renaissance art in history is that the visual art has a clear solid record. There are exceptions to

⁸⁴ Esther Mulders, *The Green Middle Ages: The Depiction and Use of Plants in the Western World 600-1600* (Amsterdam University Press, 2022): 240.

⁸⁵ Rebekah Rhodes, "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch," *Magazén 4*, no. 2 (2023): 332.

⁸⁶ E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 167.

⁸⁷ Jessie Ann Owens, "Music Historiography and the Definition of 'Renaissance.'" *Notes* 47, no. 2 (1990): 307.

⁸⁸ *IBID*, 307.

this statement when physical art is destroyed, or in the case of performance art, where only recordings may survive. With music, the only way to prove that polyphony was present or multiple people were singing at once would be found in the sheet music written at the time. Because of this, the scholarship on music is limited, or interpreted on a small scope condemned to stay within musicology. Scholar Howard Mayer Brown brings this discussion up when discussing Renaissance music but with the solution that, “enough archival records have already been published to permit some tentative conclusions,” that there were multiple singers creating a polyphonic choir in the 15th century.⁸⁹ This same point is brought up in Fenlon’s text on music in the Renaissance, saying, “it seems unlikely that we shall ever know precisely what kind of music graced these interiors and it is hard to progress beyond generalization.”⁹⁰ Kate Van Orden urges scholars, when looking at sheet music, to make sure to ask the question, “is the work before you a composition or just a transcription of a common practice?”⁹¹ Frank Tirro cites author Hiley as explaining that, “most music in the Middle Ages and Renaissance was performed from memory, and its intervallic structure was learnt not as a series of visual signs on a page but in terms of hexachord constructions and solmization syllables.”⁹² This makes the process of analyzing even harder because, as a reader, one must make a guess as to whether a simple sheet of music also included improvisation or if the notes written were the extent of the composition. Thoroughbass

⁸⁹ Howard Mayer Brown, “Choral Music in the Renaissance.” *Early Music* 6, no. 2 (1978): 165.

⁹⁰ Iain Fenlon “Music and Domestic Devotion in the Age of Reform.” In *Domestic Devotions in Early Modern Italy*, edited by Maya Corry, Marco Faini, and Alessia Meneghin (Brill, 2019): 90.

⁹¹ Kate Van Orden “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 212.

⁹² Frank Tirro, “Music of the Renaissance.” *The Musical Quarterly* 68, no. 2 (1982): 209.

is the term commonly associated with this practice. It is an abridgement of notation in which, instead of writing down every single note of an instrumental accompaniment, only the bass part was written by the composer.⁹³ Within *The Garden of Earthly Delights* there is the physical presence of sheet music, but as a viewer, one must remember that this could be Thoroughbass notation implied by the lack of multiple melodies at once, leading the viewer to imagine how the rest of the composition may have sounded on top of the foundational notation. This same concept is applied to the field of art with regards to Bosch's work, stating the practice of the viewer being led, "to engage with the painting in an imaginative way, enacting a form of vision that oscillates between what one actually sees and what one expects to see, based on memories of images seen elsewhere."⁹⁴ It is not always the case that the viewer has to fill in the blanks for a composition but, "as is sometimes the case in paintings of this type, the music itself is legible and forms part of our reading of the picture."⁹⁵ Despite these difficulties, the scholarship that does exist will be discussed and does give possible insight into the meanings of visual works of art, as well as helps to contextualize the Northern Renaissance culturally as a whole.

Because music during the Middle Ages underwent a change stylistically, it is important to discuss the music of the troubadours as the inspiration or cause for separation from this style in the Northern Renaissance. Despite Bosch's painting being from the transitional period between

⁹³ Hugo Leichtentritt, "The Renaissance Attitude towards Music." *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 621.

⁹⁴ Paul Vandebroek in, Pilar Silva Morato, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition*. (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado, 2016): 137.

⁹⁵ Iain Fenlon "Music and Domestic Devotion in the Age of Reform." In *Domestic Devotions in Early Modern Italy*, edited by Maya Corry, Marco Faini, and Alessia Meneghin (Brill, 2019): 90.

the Middle Ages and the Renaissance, it is important to keep an open mind to the idea that music styles and practices from the 13th century may have influenced those of the early 16th.

Troubadour style may have died down in popularity by the time of Hieronymus, but the forms share similarities with those of the madrigal in the later Middle Ages. C. J. Tabor places great value on the influence of these artists, saying, “few literatures have exerted so profound an influence on the writings of later poets.”⁹⁶ Tabor cites troubadours as being the writers to which ‘joglers’ would sing, mainly lyrics of courtly love, with war as an incentive to garner this reward.⁹⁷ One of the most important counterarguments to Tabor is found in the writing of L.M. Wright three decades after the former’s text. One of the first arguments made by Wright is that there was a much less distinct differentiation between troubadours and joglers and that the majority of the authors sang their own works.⁹⁸ The use of the word troubadour is also mentioned by Wright, who explains that the term within the context of the Middle Ages could be applied to anyone who wrote or composed anything at all, lyric or narrative, with or without music.⁹⁹ Another term introduced by Wright is a *menestral*, often applied to both wandering and court jongleurs. However, *menestral*, like the loosely used title troubadour, was also applied to goldsmiths, painters, builders, blacksmiths, tailors, scribes, or any type of craftsman.¹⁰⁰ This is important to note when analyzing a piece of scholarship, for it widens the scope as to who

⁹⁶ C. J. Tabor, “The Troubadours,” *Folklore* 40, no. 4 (1929): 346.

⁹⁷ IBID, 357.

⁹⁸ L. M. Wright, “Misconceptions Concerning the Troubadours, Trouvères and Minstrels,” *Music & Letters* 48, no. 1 (1967): 37.

⁹⁹ IBID, 38.

¹⁰⁰ IBID, 36.

scholars may actually be referencing, making confirmation more difficult. Readers may come across an author who defines Troubadour as only a lyricist, whereas another may be referencing a generalized writer of the arts. Because the scope can change due to an author's own definition of the word, it is important as a reader to become aware of each historian's own individual definition before reading.

Author Laurie A. Finke writes mainly on the rhetoric of desire in the Courtly Lyrics used by these troubadours, discussing how these poems were used in relationships both political and fiscal.¹⁰¹ These relationships were helped along by the fact that historians have cited troubadours as consorting with the higher classes.¹⁰² Knowing that Bosch was a part of these higher classes, if troubadours still worked and performed during his time, he would have had experienced or witnessed them at festivals and court parties. Historian C.J. Tabor writes of this relationship in an article from as early as 1929, mentioning how the troubadours of the north differed from the rest of Europe but only in terms of subject matter. Instead of the courtly lyric, the north lyricists wrote "chansons de gestes," epic romances that consisted of improvised accounts of the deeds of warriors.¹⁰³ The text highlights the various practices of the troubadours across Europe in the Middle Ages, emphasizing the recurring theme of love and war within the poems, but does not discuss how a relationship may have existed between this practice and the other arts.

In terms of valuable context these texts provide, is important to bring especially Finke's text into the discussion because it ends with the statement that there are no records of any trobairitz, or the

¹⁰¹ Laurie A. Finke, "The Rhetoric of Desire in the Courtly Lyric," in *Feminist Theory, Women's Writing*, 29-74 (Cornell University Press, 1992): 37.

¹⁰² C. J. Tabor, "The Troubadours," *Folklore* 40, no. 4 (1929): 350.

¹⁰³ IBID, 354.

female equivalent to the troubadours, after 1250, despite the continuation of the Courtly Lyrics beyond this date.¹⁰⁴ This same author fails to confirm how long the male counterpart of the trobairitz stayed prevalent; therefore, it is possible to suppose that the decline of their popularity was a slower process. Edmund A. Bowles touches on this, however, by stating that the troubadour and the jongleur were gradually supplanted by more specialized minstrels accompanied by a band of musicians.¹⁰⁵ These texts provide a better understanding of the context and timeline associated with particular musical practices throughout the Middle Ages.

It is well summarized by author Richard Pestell in 1987 that, “the presently accepted approach to the performance of medieval music can best be characterized as Puritan in its desire to rid the music of any richness or decoration.”¹⁰⁶ An example of this simplicity is provided by author W. L. Smoldon in an article discussing medieval church dramas. In the text, Smoldon explains the various types of church dramas, in addition to the types of compositions utilized, featuring single voca a wide variety only musical feature.¹⁰⁷ To reiterate what was said in the introduction of this paper, Smoldon makes it a point to reference how much the hatred of the jongleurs presence at liturgical ceremonies has been emphasized throughout the primary sources,

¹⁰⁴ Laurie A. Finke, “The Rhetoric of Desire in the Courtly Lyric,” in *Feminist Theory, Women’s Writing*, 29-74 (Cornell University Press, 1992): 74.

¹⁰⁵ Edmund A. Bowles, “Musical Instruments at the Medieval Banquet,” *Revue Belge de Musicologie/Belgisch Tijdschrift Voor Muzie Kwetenschap* 12, no. ¼ (1958): 41.

¹⁰⁶ Richard Pestell, “Medieval Art and the Performance of Medieval Music,” *Early Music* 15, no. 1 (1987): 57.

¹⁰⁷ W. L. Smoldon, “Medieval Church Drama and the Use of Musical Instruments,” *The Musical Times* 103, no. 1438 (1962): 836.

such as Church Councils, reports of ceremonies, and extracts from account registers.¹⁰⁸ The lack of instruments is again counter-argued by author James McKinnon, who makes the claim that it is commonly known amongst musicologists that a great variety of musical instruments were freely employed in medieval liturgical music.¹⁰⁹ It is also interesting to note that McKinnon's text comes only six years after Smoldon's, despite having polar opposite arguments. Using contemporary medieval sources, the author maintains his own argument that instruments have nothing to do with liturgical usage by the end of the text.¹¹⁰ The commonly held reference among musicologists that McKinnon features at the beginning of the text is an interesting inclusion because it makes the author's argument seem more effective when there is not a need to be. The idea that instruments were not used in liturgical settings appears in this discourse as the agreed upon fact, but McKinnon states the opposite to create a purpose for his text. However, this point is minor, as the rest of the text continues to feature the various iconographies featured in Medieval Psalm Commentaries. The text is unique in that it discusses how the Church Fathers justified the inclusion of instruments in psalm commentaries by interpreting them purely as allegorical references to concepts or objects in the Bible, as well as an explanation behind each of the more popular symbols and meanings.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁸ W. L. Smoldon, "Medieval Church Drama and the Use of Musical Instruments," *The Musical Times* 103, no. 1438 (1962): 837.

¹⁰⁹ James W. McKinnon, "Musical Instruments in Medieval Psalm Commentaries and Psalters," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 21, no. 1 (1968): 3.

¹¹⁰ IBID, 4.

¹¹¹ IBID, 8.

Pestell, however, aims to approach the topic differently, considering musical performance as it pertains to a larger context of the medieval attitude towards the arts that was missing mainly in the Tabor and Finke texts.¹¹² The Puritan view suggested by Pestell is the counter-argument for the rest of the author's discourse. It is argued by Pestell that the decorative, symbolic, and expressive characteristics of medieval visual art are mirrored in the music with the multiplication of melodies and instruments within compositions.¹¹³ Written in 1987, this text is one of the first to highlight the similarities between the two mediums, including the importance of aesthetic qualities, and the increasing of expressive resources.¹¹⁴ In addition to highlighting the similarities, Pestell goes as far as to made an analogy between the music of the Middle Ages and the architectural adornments on a building, saying that as these features enhance the aesthetics of the building, the multiple lines of melodies and harmonies enhance the composition in polyphonic music.¹¹⁵ This scholarship is rare in the sense that it relates the different mediums to each other within a context as opposed to remaining solely within either art history or music history. J. P. Burkholder touches on this as well by saying that social and cultural history, as well as values, beliefs, and limitations of the institutions they serve, all have a strong impact on what and how medieval musicians compose music.¹¹⁶ This acts as a simple definition of music theory,

¹¹² Richard Pestell, "Medieval Art and the Performance of Medieval Music," *Early Music* 15, no. 1 (1987): 57.

¹¹³ IBID, 57.

¹¹⁴ IBID, 60-63.

¹¹⁵ IBID, 63.

¹¹⁶ J. P. Burkholder, "Music Theory and Musicology," *The Journal of Musicology* 11, no. 1 (1993): 12.

as opposed to music history. Burkholder maintains that music theory and music history should be seen as the same field despite involving differing methods. This text differs from the others on this topic because it discusses the possible ways in which historians can approach this specific topic. Burkholder goes as far as to say that music theory in general is better when it is historically conscious, and on the reverse, that music history is better it is theoretically informed.¹¹⁷ Even though the text discusses the various methodologies that the author encourages others to use, it does not single out a specific cultural context as an example. Because of this, the end of the text stands out even more when medieval music is mentioned. When completing a thought on the various misunderstandings within musicology, Burkholder summarizes his argument by saying that stylistic heterogeneity has been a basic tool of musical construction since medieval liturgical music of solo polyphony with choral chant.¹¹⁸

Because of its close relationship to the arts, music in a devotional setting is one of the most talked about aspects of the discourse for the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. The argument as to whether or not music was present in liturgical practices follows the same difficulties mentioned previously, caused by a lack of proof that leads to mainly conjecture. Pestell cites a frequent occurrence of texts condemning the use of instruments in church.¹¹⁹ This can be somewhat confusing as a reader after the author had also stated how the church used instrumentation to adorn compositions to make a comparison to architecture details. It is the

¹¹⁷ J. P. Burkholder, "Music Theory and Musicology," *The Journal of Musicology* 11, no. 1 (1993):

13.

¹¹⁸ IBID, 22.

¹¹⁹ Richard Pestell, "Medieval Art and the Performance of Medieval Music," *Early Music* 15, no. 1 (1987): 66.

contention of this paper to assume that what Pestell is attempting to say is that the instruments the church chose to include in compositions were specifically chosen as slight adornments that decorated the main feature of the composition: the human voice. Furthermore, even if the condemnation of instruments is heavily cited throughout scholarship, that this is not encompassing of all instruments, rather just a testament to the level of dislike towards a specific set of instruments. However, Pestell makes the distinction that it is not necessarily the performance itself that is condemned, but the disorderly conduct that can result from this performance.¹²⁰

With regards to iconography created within the art of music, Pestell mentions the importance of the explication of scriptures in their aspect of providing a mystical approach to God.¹²¹ Author Joan Rimmer mentions this iconography as well but instead mentions how the material is neglected with regards to dance, and mainly is discussed within the context of music.¹²² Apart from devotional musical symbols, iconography as a whole is another frequently discussed topic in music theory and music history discourse.

The patronage of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* is not the most helpful for this argument, as it would have mainly been seen by a man of higher status who had a better chance of literacy than the common medieval man. The argument as to the patronage itself shows an example of how the work would be presented and for whom. There is a lack of information regarding why Antonio de Beatis was invited to view the grounds of Henry III in 1517 other than

¹²⁰ Richard Pestell, "Medieval Art and the Performance of Medieval Music," *Early Music* 15, no. 1 (1987): 65.

¹²¹ IBID, 60.

¹²² Joan Rimmer, "Medieval Instrumental Dance Music," *Music & Letters* 72, no. 1 (1991): 61.

his accompaniment by successful Cardinal Luigi D’Aragona.¹²³ D’Aragona was accompanied by Beatis on a lengthy expedition between 1517 and 1518 where the duo visited multiple courts of Northern Europe. Knowing Beatis’ profession as a biographer leads to the suggestion that his job was to note the travels of the Cardinal as the main character accompanied by Beatis working under him. This makes it all the more interesting that they were invited to the court of Henry III, as well as the fact that the triptych was opened for the visit. Nowhere is it confirmed that the Nassau court was unsuccessful contemporarily, but a visit from a successful Cardinal acts as evidence for such a reason. It exists as an example of the type of visitors allowed to view the piece, while also providing a piece of evidence for how Henry III wished to be viewed and remembered. Author Jasper Steen has included in a series of research on the Nassau family that they have been gifted the unfortunate reputation of being notoriously unsuccessful at state building.¹²⁴ The commissioning of art by courts rulers has often been cited as having other intentions other than purely decoration. However, it must remain purely conjecture why Henry III may have commissioned the triptych by Bosch. What is not conjecture is that the work was displayed for special visits to the court exemplified by not only Beatis and D’Aragona but many 16th century visitors including heads of state, and other leading court figures.¹²⁵ The audience then becomes completely deliberate and decided by Henry III or Englebert II both of Nassau

¹²³ E.H. Gombrich, “The Earliest Description of Bosch’s Garden of Delight.” *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 30 (1967): 403.

¹²⁴ Jasper Steen, “The Nassaus and State Formation in Pre-Modern Germany,” in *Dynasties and State Formation in Early Modern Europe*, 165-86 (Amsterdam University Press, 2023): 169.

¹²⁵ Hans Belting, *Garden of Earthly Delights* (Munich: Prestel, 2005): 71.

making historians such as Hans Belting believe that the work had a specifically commissioned subject matter as opposed to one where Bosch had more artistic license.¹²⁶

Having the knowledge that the patron was a part of a higher class within society as well as the intended extended audience makes the subject matter all the more interesting. It is also interesting that it is nowhere mentioned that the common public was ever allowed to see the work. This particular exclusion is brought up in numerous texts, including one written by Tirro who states, “the absence of an authoritative and balanced introductory survey [of music] is a hallmark of elitism and the intentional exclusion of amateurs.”¹²⁷ This mention of the elitist nature of music theory and history is a common notion in this field’s discourse and makes an interesting discussion when applied to the life of someone like Bosch who grew up privileged and is cited as also being elitist. It would be a piece of conjecture to say that Henry III or Englebert II chose a subject matter they believed belonged higher than the common public, however, only allowing the elite to view the work is intentional and exclusionary in nature. Devotional subject matter was often visualized in art work in the Middle Ages to eliminate the difficulties caused by illiteracy, but education was not heavily available to all with the elite being the most educated.¹²⁸ Also mentioned by Rimmer, the disparity between education qualities is consistent throughout multiple fields with highly learned and literate people being intimately acquainted with contemporary social dances, whereas others within lower social classes were

¹²⁶ Hans Belting, *Garden of Earthly Delights*. (Munich: Prestel, 2005): 71.

¹²⁷ Frank Tirro, “Music of the Renaissance,” *The Musical Quarterly* 68, no. 2 (1982): 208.

¹²⁸ Lynn Thorndike, “Elementary and Secondary Education in the Middle Ages,” *Speculum* 15, no. 4 (1940): 402.

not.¹²⁹ Recent scholarship has seen a change in focus demolishing this elitism by producing nuanced views of devotional images in private devotional exercises, as opposed to those in a public setting, i.e. church.¹³⁰ This is cited by author Mariët Westermann as being a result of a more active process of cultural production, reception, and transformation in the range of studies of meaning, something that a more traditional iconography did not necessarily allow.¹³¹ It is the shift from devotional to cultural that allows this expansion in discourse.

It is known that “madrigalesque compositions were very likely sung in 16th century Italy <...> at civic and courtly ceremonies, during the intermedia staged between acts of plays, and at unusually sumptuous banquets.”¹³² Leichtentritt introduces the term “intermezzi” to describe this occurrence defining them as, “dramatic scenes inserted between the acts of a drama, a sort of entr’acte music and dramatic performance which had nothing in common with the drama proper.”¹³³ This cultural practice is also cited within the same text as sometimes being the main attraction for patrons because of its dramatics. But this new form of vocal music is not to be confused with the madrigal of the 13th and 14th centuries, with the new form applying the techniques of the Dutch style to secular music remodeled using Italian characteristics.¹³⁴ These

¹²⁹ Joan Rimmer, “Medieval Instrumental Dance Music,” *Music & Letters* 72, no. 1 (1991): 68.

¹³⁰ Mariët Westermann, “After Iconography and Iconoclasm: Current Research in Netherlandish Art, 1566-1700.” *The Art Bulletin* 84, no. 2 (2002): 356.

¹³¹ IBID, 359.

¹³² Howard Mayer Brown, “Choral Music in the Renaissance.” *Early Music* 6, no. 2 (1978): 168.

¹³³ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude towards Music.” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 616.

¹³⁴ IBID, 613.

characteristic differences are described by author Hugo Leichtentritt as follows; “madrigal music is an entirely free invention of the composer, whereas chanson and Lied are almost always founded on some cantus firmus, a folksong melody.”¹³⁵ This differentiation is important to note because it highlights this shift to a more cultural value that is dictated by other classes than those in the high courts. Despite this, as a man of means, Hieronymus Bosch would have been aware of these ceremonies before they became popular culture, as well as after the movement into the mainstream occurred.

Understanding the music of the time is also important to art historians because it may give insight into the meaning of the work that one might not gain otherwise. This is exemplified in Fenlon’s scholarship when discussing Marietta’s self-portrait, the music discussed being “Madonna per Voi Ardo,” as the piece featured in the work. Choosing to feature this work is significant because the subject matter, according to Fenlon, suggests “someone important and now lost even in her personal life.”¹³⁶ This view into the artist’s personal life is important to note because the majority of what is known about music from the Northern Renaissance is about the public contexts, not the domestic.¹³⁷ This scholarship written in 2019 is an example of a shift that occurs in the discourse suggested by Burkholder to mesh together music history and music

¹³⁵ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude towards Music.” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 613.

¹³⁶ Iain Fenlon, “Music and Domestic Devotion in the Age of Reform,” In *Domestic Devotions in Early Modern Italy*, edited by Maya Corry, Marco Faini, and Alessia Meneghin, (Brill, 2019): 90.

¹³⁷ IBID, 92.

theory in his 1993 text.¹³⁸ The texts preceding these about music mainly focus on the formalistic aspects, like in the work of Treittler, Burkholder, and Tirro.

Author Elizabeth Eva Leach writes about the study of fourteenth-century music and cites the visual arts as being crucial in providing a richer understanding of musical life.¹³⁹ In an introduction by Patrick Macey, the paper by Leach is described as encouraging greater integration of music and its social functions in studies of history and culture of the fourteenth century.¹⁴⁰

Another major aspect of a music historical approach to the Northern Renaissance is formalistic. Tirro breaks down the discourse on the Renaissance into five sections; “elements, modal theory and the eightfold system, systems of twelve nodes, and the transition to major and minor keys.”¹⁴¹ All of these sections are purely formal and do not speak to compositions in a stylistic manner. The same author does speak on the style of Renaissance music when mentioning the composer Palestrina describing it as, “Dutch in technique,” but that, “the sense of beauty of sound, fine balance of all parts, just proportions, is a characteristic Italian trait.”¹⁴² The first sections described by Tirro are formal elements that can almost only be applied to music,

¹³⁸ J. P. Burkholder, “Music Theory and Musicology,” *The Journal of Musicology* 11, no. 1 (1993):

12.

¹³⁹ Elizabeth Eva Leach, “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 189.

¹⁴⁰ Patrick Macey, “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth, and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 189.

¹⁴¹ Frank Tirro, “Music of the Renaissance.” *The Musical Quarterly* 68, no. 2 (1982): 209.

¹⁴² IBID, 612.

but in his text, he also provides approaches that are more broad, like the balance of all parts and just proportions, that can easily also be applied to visual art. Another approach to music that can be applied to the visual arts is introduced by a discussion of the lute, with Leichtentritt mentioning that to read it, “one must first find the key, which is not always easy, and then translate note for note into our notation, which is very troublesome.”¹⁴³ Even though he does not explicitly state it, this is similar to the approach of art historians who build up dictionaries of iconographies and the accompanying definitions in order to decode works of art.

The overall synopsis of these scholars on music and its relation to art in the periods leading up to and through the 15th century share a trend of encouragement aimed at future historians to do more research on this topic. Leach, however, does give credit to the discourse in recent years, saying that it has evolved with a new focus on melody and harmony replacing what previously had focused on forms and rhythmic structures.¹⁴⁴ The study of musicology in general is cited as being in a decline by author Kate Van Orden. Orden describes a time where, “a sea change in musicology that drew scholars away from the discipline’s strengths in medieval and Renaissance studies and toward later repertoires,” happening in the 1990s.¹⁴⁵ The methodology is also brought into question within this text, with Leach citing psychoanalysis and psychology

¹⁴³ Hugo Leichtentritt, “The Renaissance Attitude towards Music.” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915): 621.

¹⁴⁴ Elizabeth Eva Leach, “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 191.

¹⁴⁵ Kate Van Orden “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 210.

being used to scrutinize the gendering of song.¹⁴⁶ Van Orden cites these same critical approaches as pulling “energy away from archival research, source studies, and stylistic histories that had been definitive of sixteenth-century music studies.”¹⁴⁷

The methodologies in both music and art history and theories have evolved over time. A quick introduction can summarize this evolution by saying that scholarship from the beginning of the 20th century is the foundation upon which later 20th and early 21st century scholarship builds upon. The first half of the 20th century, featuring the discourse from Leichtentritt, Tabor, Bowles and Thorndike, are all historical in approach, citing primary sources for the information given. What they lack is an analysis of a piece of media after introducing the history. In music history, Tabor and Bowles both discuss the history of the troubadours, as well as including the meanings behind the stories within the lyrics of courtly love, but do not take it that one step further and apply it to contemporary examples, or even artwork from the Middle Ages. Leichtentritt does mention art in his work on the topic but does not use the knowledge of instruments to analyze a work of art and instead uses artistic depictions contemporary to the Middle Ages as evidence for the instruments used. As the scholarship on music moves further into the middle of the 20th-century, texts from Smoldon and McKinnon show the shift into a larger focus on iconographies as well as folklore motifs. Even though both approach the topic through a music historical lens, both provide a series of popular medieval symbols seen in the visual arts and break down their meanings as it relates to non-secular settings. In art history, a

¹⁴⁶ Elizabeth Eva Leach, “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 192.

¹⁴⁷ Kate Van Orden “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015): 210.

similar pattern is shown, beginning with early texts providing research for Bosch's patronage, and non-secular readings of the work in texts from Gombrich, Snyder, and Reutersward. But this changes in the later half of the 20th century, shifting to applying known iconography to other works of art, as well as providing completely new readings of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* such as in Dixon, Moray, and Rhodes. Because the foundations from the early 20th century exist, authors such as Dixon are able to re-examine the work of Bosch, finding new interpretations like within the context of alchemy, fixing possible previously made mistakes. In addition to this, with more recent scholarship, especially within the Burkholder text, there is an encouragement to start meshing together music theory and music history with art history. It is within this type of scholarship that this paper aims to be placed.

One of the modern studies of the work done by a music blogger posting on the popular website Tumblr released a recording of the composition written out on the buttocks of one of the sinners in the lower left corner of the right panel. An article written by Sean Michaels summarizes the recording process done by blogger Amelia who transposed the notation into a modern form before playing it herself.¹⁴⁸ Those that find themselves curious as to how this may sound can easily find multiple different versions that have been released since on Youtube.com. Because the composition does not use lyrics it is somewhat difficult to garner any meaning from the research and recording. However, one can easily discern a specific type of mood that is fitting to the composition, and especially the music's specific placement within the work. It is the opinion of this author that the aura created by the music is not one of comfort and distills a sense of uneasiness to the visual setting. As well be discussed during the analysis portion of this paper

¹⁴⁸ Sean Michaels, "Hidden Sheet Music in Hieronymus Bosch Triptych Recorded by Blogger," *The Guardian*, last modified February 13, 2014, accessed April 21, 2024.

many of the notes do not belong to the same key causing disharmony when they are played at the same time. It is fair to make the suggestion that this disharmony is the main causation for distress when listening to it, perfectly pairing itself with the uncomfortable figures scattered throughout the right panel of the triptych. Apart from providing the recording for the sheet music this scholarship does not extend far beyond existing as a fascinating addition to the enjoyment of the triptych. Due to the lack of lyrics, the sheet music provides little as to the meaning of the work overall but the musician blogger's addition to the scholarship remains a fun and interesting addition.

Having access to the research that has already been done up until now will give this paper the ability to re-examine specific aspects of Bosch's work in the hopes of suggesting new meanings. The relationship between music and the arts is not a new subject in a generalized sense, but it is underdeveloped when it comes to the Middle Ages, especially within *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, that is so frequently deemed a non-secular work. James Haar, when discussing this same need for discourse, writes that the struggle, "to write about music in a way that stresses its relationship to the visual arts and to literature is an enduring one; we never quite succeed, but we continue to try."¹⁴⁹ It is this resilience that makes this field successful.

It is the goal of this paper to add to the growing discourse that has already been produced by previous historians and scholars. It is unique in the sense that it is a combination of the approaches used by art historians, as well as music historians and musicologists, in order to create a more in-depth view of the culture of the Northern Renaissance, as well as the relationships between the two fields of discourse discussed above. The majority of the sources

¹⁴⁹ James Haar, "Classicism and Mannerism in 16th-Century Music." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1994): 5.

cited on Bosch discuss the biblical and cultural references with *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, whereas this paper will discuss the musicological elements and how they can be used to analyze the triptych. This paper commends Dixon on the uniqueness of her approach and eventual findings using alchemical knowledge to explore new elements of the work that previous authors had touched on but did not go in depth about. By approaching Bosch's work with a musicological approach, the relationship between music and art can highlight additional discoveries, summarizing the goal of this paper. Because the subject matter is analyzing a work of visual art, the discourse will more than likely find its place amongst others within the realm of art history over those of music history and theory. The paper will use musicological approaches but will not necessarily aim to extrapolate any groundbreaking findings for the field. Despite this, it is still the hope of this author that the research, analysis, and conclusion may be used in the future to inspire research of this kind in both fields.

Research Methodology

The following discourse will be qualitative and use various methodologies, including formalism, structuralism and semiotics, and new historicism. The approach taken in the research is that the forms featured in music are also present in the painting *The Garden of Earthly Delights* by Hieronymus Bosch. It will be the use of all three of these methodologies that will push the argument this paper aims to make and will back up the claims made. This type of analysis will be important to the field because it is unique in its approach and will provide new meanings not typical of the scholarship on this topic. Most typically, the scholarship that has been previously mentioned in this paper analyzed works of art in comparison to others within the same medium. This approach to Bosch's work will focus on the aspects of the painting that feature musical instruments, sheet music, and the same formal patterns that occur in music of the time.

This paper will follow the basis stated by Anne D'Alleva that, "theory as a process of formulating research questions and methodology as the process of trying to answer these questions."¹⁵⁰ The questions included in this paper will include those such as what are the iconographies shared between music and the visual arts, and what do they tell us about work from each field? What meanings are exposed when the iconographies of music history are applied to Bosch's *The Garden of Earthly Delights*? And how has this relationship been approached in discourse?

Author Anne D'Alleva states in her book on critical theory that, "using a theoretical approach to art history means that you channel your visual and contextual analysis into a more

¹⁵⁰ Anne D'Alleva, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. (Laurence King, 2013): 13.

focused inquiry around a particular set of issues.”¹⁵¹ The visual analysis of this paper will be mostly formalistic in style. A formalist approach is not interested in the contextual aspect that D’alleva mentions. Instead, as stated by Laurie Schneider Adams, “they take on art on its own formal terms and experience it according to their personal aesthetic response.”¹⁵² This paper during this analysis will describe the formal tools used that are both applied to the music and visual arts. There will be a large section dedicated solely to the formal analysis of works the art works used for the text’s argument. In addition to this, there will be a shorter formal analysis of the chosen musical works. When discussing a work like *The Garden of Earthly Delights*, this type of analysis will be important because of how many individual elements are featured. The historian Laurie Schneider Adams introduces the term “multiplicity” defining its process in art as, “each detail strikes the viewer as an independent element, even though it is also part of a larger formal arrangement.”¹⁵³ The massive amount of the independent elements in Bosch’s work will help to show the similarities between visual and musical mediums during the Renaissance. The task of summarizing each element will be lengthy but necessary for this paper to do.

It has been exposed that, “most stories can be reduced to one of a few underlying basic plots, and most characters are variations on a few types, which structuralist narratology aims to inventory.”¹⁵⁴ In order to understand Bosch’s Garden, the structuralist methodology and

¹⁵¹ Anne D’Alleva, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. (Laurence King, 2013): 11.

¹⁵² Laurie Schneider Adams, *Art and Psychoanalysis*, (Westview Press, Boulder, 1994): 29.

¹⁵³ IBID, 27.

¹⁵⁴ Vincent B. Leitch, *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism* (Norton, W.W. & Company, Inc, 2018): 22.

semiotics will be instrumental in providing background, making the meaning presented more apparent. Structuralism, as defined by author Peter Barry, is, “the belief that things cannot be understood in isolation, they have to be seen in the context of the larger structures they are part of.”¹⁵⁵ The formal analysis will provide the defining of all of the elements within the works discussed, whereas the structuralist approach will help expose the meanings attributed to the symbols as defined by the culture context of the Northern and Italian Renaissances. When discussing this approach, D’alleva defines iconology as “identifying motifs and images in works of art, often requires extensive knowledge of a culture and its processes of image-making.”¹⁵⁶ Having this requirement of background knowledge of a culture brings up the importance of semiology, defined by Saussure as “a science that studies the life of signs within society.”¹⁵⁷ Especially within the massive realm of religion, signs may produce different meanings over time. Knowing the specific meanings of signs for the Northern and Italian Renaissance will be instrumental to this paper’s success. Iconology is the sort of culmination of the two of these terms, with D’Alleva defining it as, “the identifications achieved through iconographic analysis and attempts to explain how and why such imagery was chosen in terms of the broader cultural background of the image.”¹⁵⁸

In addition to understanding the works themselves, it will be necessary to discuss the various discourse that has been said on this topic. D’Alleva mentions this importance in her book *Methods and Theories of Art History*, saying, “an important aspect of iconographic/iconological

¹⁵⁵ Peter Barry, *Beginning Theory*, (Manchester University Press, 2009): 38.

¹⁵⁶ Anne D’Alleva, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. (Laurence King, 2013): 19.

¹⁵⁷ Ferdinand de Saussure, *Course in General Linguistics* (McGraw-Hill Book Company, 1916): 16.

¹⁵⁸ Anne D’Alleva, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. (Laurence King, 2013): 19.

analysis is the comparison with textual sources.”¹⁵⁹ This comparing of iconographies with textual sources can also be related to the process of New Historicism. This type of methodology implements a parallel reading of literary and non-literary texts of the same period.

This paper itself can be seen as New Historicist because it compares visual arts with music. It can be argued that these two types of mediums are different enough to fill the roles of literary vs. non-literary. But it is not the aim of this paper to make that specific argument because it has been mentioned in the discourse on this subject that music of this specific time aimed to convey meaning the same way the visual arts did. Placing this argument on hold, the new historicist methodology will assign the role of literary to the visual arts, and the non-literary to the sheet music that will be analyzed. The entire concept of New Historicism is to place equal value or weight on both of these mediums, and constantly inform or interrogate each other.¹⁶⁰ Another important aspect to this methodology is to read the visual artwork in the same way that the musical work is typically read.¹⁶¹ This type of methodology will be important to this paper because of the argument it is trying to make that there is a strong relationship between the music and art of the time of the Renaissance. It is my contention as an author that approaching it using the New Historicist method will make this goal successful.

Besides using this type of methodology to approach the works themselves, this type of methodology will also be useful when compiling the various discourse on this topic as well. Within the Literature Review, there will be featured a lot of different scholarships spanning over several different eras of art history. New Historicism can be used to show the difference between

¹⁵⁹ D’Alleva Anne, *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. (Laurence King, 2013): 24.

¹⁶⁰ Peter Barry, *Beginning Theory*, (Manchester University Press, 2009): 166.

¹⁶¹ IBID, 172.

different texts, as well as why certain arguments have been made. An example of this could be that a text about the Renaissance written in the early 20th century might differ from one written much later, and this could be due to various contextual instances. In a text written by White on this specific methodology, an important quote to remember is that “our explanations of historical structures and processes are thus determined more by what we leave out of our representations than by what we put in.”¹⁶² When discussing the discourse, it will be important to highlight what specific historians might leave out and why they might have done so. In doing this, this paper will eliminate potential bias that may occur, therefore creating a more solid argument.

¹⁶² Hayden White, “The Historical Text as Literary Artifact,” *Clio* 3, no. 3. (June 1974): 90.

Analysis

Bosch's painting, titled *The Garden of Earthly Delights* is a triptych on oak made up on three panels when fully opened (Figure 1). The work, when closed, or how it would have been for the majority of its medieval contemporary existence, differs greatly from the colorful panels on the inside (Figure 2). For the first part of this analysis, the focus will be placed on the visuals that are present when the triptych is opened followed by a brief discussion of what is presented when the work is closed. The largest panel located in the center is flanked by two smaller panels that, when closed, cover the inside. Some of the visual aspects of this work that this analysis will focus on are the overall storyline as assumed by scholars and the viewers at the time, the actual depictions of instruments themselves, the musical forms that are present in the work, and what conclusions can be created by looking at these particular aspects.

Dissonance

Within the background information segment of this text, the term dissonance was introduced. This occurs when a note is transitioned to another and the overlapping that occurs with the goal of eliminating gaps into the music. Visual dissonance occurs when the viewer experiences a disparity between what one expects to see and what one actually sees. When hearing a musical composition especially during the Middle Ages harmonies were thought to be most appropriate for devotional settings for when a harmony is played out it creates a sense of comfort especially because it is what is expected of the composition. When polyphony becomes priority over harmony these moments of dissonance are found more often. When one note is transitioning from one to another that is not within the terms of a harmony there is a moment of disharmony and ultimately discomfort until the note is resolved. Within visual dissonance the disparity between what we see and what we expect to see is easily applied to music. The

discomfort is caused when what we hear is not what we expect when the two dissonant notes are played together and is only resolved when one note ends or turns into one that fits within the harmony or key. Visual dissonance is also present in music under the context of notation. The use of thoroughbass leads to a disparity between the notation within the musical composition itself and what the audience member hears. Most typically this just means the musicians likely improvised and added to the simplistic composition. A separation is then created between what the audience expects to hear and what they hear in actuality dependent upon the specific musician they witness and the choices that musician makes each time they perform the work. Despite using the same terminology, these two definitions are vastly different, but both are easily applied to this work of art. Musical dissonance, or the overlapping of notes, is exemplified by the over-abundance of figures.

There is an art historical term that is related to this referred to as *horror vacui*, or the fear of empty space. Very typical of the Italian Renaissance and Baroque periods as shown in figure 6 an abundance of figures was typical in order to eliminate the majority of the negative space in a painting or statue. Bosch's work is somewhat unique in the way that it includes not only an overload of figures, but also alchemical buildings, beasts, flora, and instruments. In music, dissonance is not purely overlapping but inevitably causes uneasiness in the listener. Until the note is resolved with the completion of the transition, the dissonant phrase does not sound how we expect and can sometimes sound like the musician is making a mistake to the untrained ear. It is clear that Bosch is not making a mistake in his work and that each figure or object is deliberate. Despite this, there is still an uneasiness that is caused. Speaking only of the inside of the triptych there is nowhere in the work that acts as a resolve for the piles of figures. As a viewer one is constantly being brought back and forth across the work with no rest due to the

effects of *horror vacui*. Only on the outside of the triptych when it is closed can the viewer find resolve for what lies within. The figures disappear and a calm if not desolate atmosphere is created. Visually the turmoil that Bosch depicts on the inner panels vanishes on the outside. If following the rules of dissonance and its resolve this acts as part of the argument that the image depicted on the outside of the triptych follow those on the inside.

Despite the work's meaning remaining somewhat of a mystery, a possible source for the painting's story comes from biblical references and the Last Judgement.¹⁶³ This specific story from the Bible was common amongst painters, including Jan van Eyck and a diptych of this scene from 1430-1440(Figure 3). This work differs somewhat from Bosch's but focusing on the right panel shows the scene of the Last Judgement split into three sections: God and the Heavens at the top, earth and mortals about to be judged in the center, and Hell and the damned down below. This separation of the Judgement, bordered by Paradise and Hell, was a recognizable frequent practice within the visual arts.¹⁶⁴ Piecing together what would have been known as the standard is important to show the visual dissonance that occurs. A viewer from this time period would look at this artwork and find the elements that are similar to the setup in Van Eyck's diptych. The dissonance occurs when the visual elements within each panel are vastly different from those featured in Van Eyck's. Now, instead of God in the center as one would expect, we find a large mysterious looking fountain, surrounded by beastly creatures. The surprise of the visual elements differing from traditional expectations encourages uneasiness in the viewer that is not resolved. It is the contention of this paper that because the meaning of the work is so

¹⁶³ Peter Glum, "Divine Judgement in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights," *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 45.

¹⁶⁴ IBID, 47.

heavily debated, historians have clung to the devotional elements of the work that are easily recognizable in an attempt to understand the work as a whole. The elements that are not traditional to a Last Judgement scene have only recently been investigated seen in the text by Dixon, and Moray.

One of the elements that is often left behind are the instruments and sheet music featured in the Hell or right panel of the work. In a musical context dissonance is shown in the sheet music featured in the right panel being played by various sinners(Figure 4). The tones that are noted do not all belong to the same key and at various points throughout the piece a disharmonious effect is created. It is a shame that Bosch did not also include a musical composition in the other panels of the triptych for one could compare the two works to see if the compositions Bosch depicts differ based on physical placement.

Using visual dissonance as a basis when approaching this work differs greatly. As is clearly visible in the work, there is an incredible number of various figures, beasts, objects, all included. Many of the bodies, as exemplified in both the central and right panels, are overlapping, and we are only able to see a portion of them as they disappear into each other. As is the goal in madrigal and polyphonic music, the overlapping of figures eliminates an exceptionally substantial portion of the space on the panels. Something that is interesting about the visual dissonance, however, is the fact that it can be applied to both Bosch's work as well as Van Eyck's. Even in the more traditional Judgement scene bodies are piled on top of each other in the Hell portion of the diptych, as well as those in the Judgement scene itself are overlapping each other in an orderly lineup. The difference between the two pieces, despite overlapping present in both, is that the overlapping of the bodies in Bosch's work appear throughout the entire triptych, whereas in Van Eyck's, they are only piled up in this way in Hell. With

dissonance in music, there is the promise of a resolve when the second note that is overlapping the first takes over and the initial note ends, leaving a solid straightforward tone. Once the straightforward tone takes over, the uncomfortableness that is caused by the two unmatched tones is also eliminated. Within the triptych, we are presented with a visual image that is never changing. We do not ever see the bodies move, therefore, the uncomfortableness caused by the compilation of bodies on top of one another is never resolved.

It is not easily apparent why Bosch may have included this specific musical composition where he did in the triptych leading the following argument to be conjecture. As previously mentioned, the music that was played within a devotional setting relied on harmonies played mainly by the organ to create a Godly aura in churches. Music played outside of this setting including folksongs were heavily looked down upon by the Church Fathers and devotees that shared this same opinion. Accepting the possibility of Englebert II being the patron places this work amongst viewers that belong to the second demographic. Knowing for certain that Bosch belonged to a religious confraternity also places him amongst them. Placing a musical composition in Hell that features dissonant phrases visualizes the opinion that this type of music belonged amongst the sinners. It is often speculated amongst historians that Bosch frowned upon activities enjoyed by the lower classes, and this work acts as evidence for such a statement.

Instrumental Analysis

Within the right panel, there are naturalistic representations of musical instruments recognized as the lute, bray harp, symphonia, triangle drum, bombard, recorder, trumpet, slide trumpet, bagpipe, as well as sheet music written both on paper and the buttock of a naked man trapped under a lute. A beastly froglike creature sitting to the right of the nude man sheet music wears a white head covering. It is important to determine who this figure is or could represent

because they appear to be leading the pile of nude figures to the left of them in song. This is not the type of headwear that a figure of the clergy or court would wear. It most resembles a wimple, worn by women in order to cover their hair, as it was seen as scandalous to reveal (Figure 5). This does not give any insight as to why this animal would be wearing this or why they might be leading the figures in a song. This creature may need further research before deciding on its role or meaning in this work.

One of the most interesting aspects of this piece is directly below this creature; a composition of music written on the nude buttocks of one of the damned (Figure 7). The sheet music has three different stanzas, showing that the melody starts from the top left corner, reading from left to right before starting the next line below it. During this period of music, this specific type of notation would have been referred to as “chromatic” because of the use of blackened notes for shorter value combined with longer values, producing a somewhat fussy ornamental style lacking the rhythmic balance of classical polyphony.¹⁶⁵ Despite this, it is clearly visible that within each stanza, there are multiple notes occurring at a time. It is difficult to read because each stanza only has three horizontal lines, whereas most modern sheet music more closely resembles the opened book to the left of the nude figure, with four horizontal lines. The notation provided by the recent musician and blogger Amelia mentioned in the Literature Review chose a different scale that provided one possible melody. But, if one were to assume that the bottom line is the same as that in the composition on the left, the first two notes written happening simultaneously on the buttock of the figure would be a G, and a D. Bosch does not include any indication that the notes are sharp or flat confirming that it is a major key. The next two easily

¹⁶⁵ James Haar, “Classicism and Mannerism in 16th-century Music.” *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. ½ (1994): 12.

visible notes are B, and then two repeated G's. These three notes make up a G major chord. Because of this, we know that the first two notes create harmony, as opposed to dissonance within this polyphonic chant. Even though it is not as evident on the nude figure, it is clear in the sheet music within the book next to it that there are two constant melodies happening at the same time. It is not a sure thing that the following reading is accurate; it can be argued that some of the notes are not exactly where this paper will claim them to be. With this being said, focusing on the bottom right stanza, the top line starts on the note of F, followed by E, D, D, A and then back up to F, followed by B, C, F, B, B. While this is happening, the bottom line starts much lower at E and jumps back and forth between G, and back down to E. Because this is happening simultaneously with the line above, it is to be argued that dissonance is present in the composition inevitably creating the same discomfort mentioned throughout this paper. An E playing at the same time as an F of the upper octave would not sound as melodic as it would if the music showed the same melody just two octaves apart. This overall, would cause discomfort in those listening and would also be hard to follow visualized by the confused and disturbed faces of those attempting to sing along behind the froglike wimple woman.

Above the sheet music is a lute that is accompanied by a harp which lays on top of it. Towards the bottom left of the image, a figure reaches out towards the instrument and is stopped by a demon resembling a monkey who grabs the figure's wrist. The demon figure, at the same time, is holding a long-pointed stick that skewers a frog on fire. The soundboard, or the top of the lute, features a lizard type animal that wraps its tail around a figure, fastening it to the instrument's neck. The harp on top of the lute features a stringed figure in the center, meaning that the strings of the harp pierce through the nude figure. Both the harp and the lute have stood as symbols throughout history as a symbol of harmony, as well as being held in the hands of the

angels. The angels who appear to be controlling the instruments in Hell use these specific instruments to torture the damned. Physically, they are shown as tools of torture, with the figure skewered by the harp strings, and mentally it can be argued that those to the right of the instrument that are unable to figure out the music are in a constant struggle of disharmony.

The symphonia is placed to the right of the lute and harp standing upright. A figure at the top cranks the instrument in eternity, while a bent over figure behind him placed a stick in between his buttocks. Inside the symphonia is a woman wearing what is undoubtedly a wimple, holding a medieval triangle. To the right of the symphonia is a figure trapped inside a blue drum being played by a beastly demon creature. There is agony visible on the face of the figure trapped inside. Above this is a nude figure who has possibly a flute coming out from the buttocks who is simultaneously struggling to hold up a large bombarde that contains a figure on fire producing smoke from the top of the instrument. There is a figure bent over below the one holding up the bombarde attempting to shut out the music by covering his ears, but the agony is still evident on his face.

The last musical form to be discussed is that of polyphony. In simple terms, polyphony is the style of simultaneously combining a number of parts, each forming an individual melody and harmonizing with each other. Bosch includes this in the music composition on the lower right panel shown with multiple notes occurring on the same vertical axis at the same time. Within medieval music, this is exemplified within non-secular madrigals, as well as secular chansons. As previously mentioned, however, Bosch would have taken the same opinion as the Church Fathers and looked down upon the chansons sung at folk celebrations and parties. Because of this the harmonious polyphony of the Church fits the piece better. *The Garden Of Earthly Delights* acts as the epitome of polyphony in the visual arts, as it is clear that there is a multitude of

different parts that altogether create a balanced work. There are multiple biblical stories happening at the same time, with the left panel featuring Adam and Eve in the Garden of Eden at the bottom, the central panel possibly representing nirvana directly before judgement, and the right panel showing the damned, and their place in Hell. A clear deliberation has occurred choosing to feature these specific scenes from specific devotional stories. If one were to read the work from left to the right it would read almost chronologically with the story of Adam and Eve acting as a possible causation for not only the chaos in the central panel but also the karma-driven aftermath in the right panel.

Another way in which this polyphony is created to make harmony is the repetition of figures amongst all three panels. Despite there being arguably three different subject matters, all three feature beastly creatures, nude human figures, and otherworldly flora. There is arguably an equal number of figures per gender with some being somewhat indiscernible as to which they belong to. It is important to bring up the concept that these figures being present in general may be on purpose to cause a sense of discomfort, but that this does not take away from the fact that they are present throughout the entire work. The highest concentration of figures being in the middle and the right inner panels is balanced out by the figures and creatures within the panel on the inner left. The same way that polyphony works as viewers look throughout the work the concentration of figures and stories ebbs and flows from either direction. Bosch furthers this by maintaining the same style, whether dramatic and beastly, amongst all of his figures, creatures, and flora. In the same way that the notes on the buttocks create harmony, the visual notes of the work all belong to the same key and, therefore, evoke balance amongst the chaos.

In addition to this the work overall is balanced between what is happening visually on the inside of the triptych versus how it appears when the entire work is closed. The outside of the

triptych acts as a complete opposite to the inside. The chaos of the inner panels is balanced by the desolate calmness of the visuals when closed.

Revealing Bosch's Commentary

The importance of these instruments in this section of the work is not accidental and is Bosch's way of making a statement about the musical cultural practices of the time. *The Garden of Earthly Delights* was completed during the end of his career coinciding with the transition between the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. Geographically during this period, the Netherlands and Italy were the leading nations in music making them inevitably the leaders in any changes occurring during this transition.¹⁶⁶ Under Pope Innocent VIII prohibitions for papal singers were imposed including the forbiddance of concubines, taverns while cardinals were unallowed to keep trumpeters and other musicians from residing or visiting their homes.¹⁶⁷ Contemporary records reveal a growth in unorthodox performances during Masses that featured wood and brass instruments and tambourines happening at the same time as Innocent VIII's regulations.¹⁶⁸ As the transition from the Middle Ages occurred so did the popularity of secular music amongst the common public with expense accounts of the *Illustre Lieve Vrouwe Broederschap* at s'Hertogenbosch in 1531-32 including a payment for diverse musicians and instruments such as a tambourine.¹⁶⁹ This *Broederschap*, or Brotherhood is the very same that Bosch belonged to with the expense report occurring just a couple decades after his death.

¹⁶⁶ Edward E. Lowinsky, "Music in the Culture of the Renaissance," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 15, no. 4 (1954): 510.

¹⁶⁷ IBID, 511.

¹⁶⁸ IBID, 513.

¹⁶⁹ IBID.

During this transition what culminates are two strong sides to the debate over which type of music should be regarded as superior: secular vs. devotional. It is beneficial to look to *The Garden of Earthly Delights* as evidence for which side of the debate Bosch placed himself. As shown in the lower righthand side of the panel on the inside of the triptych features the only place throughout the entire work that includes any obvious allusion or literal representation of music. The figures attempting to play the composition written on the nude figure led by the beastly wimple dotting frog. Hertogenbosch, the area in which the artist lived, was frequently filled with lively music in court circles.¹⁷⁰ It has been cited amongst scholarship that Bosch did not approve of these celebrations and thought of them as being morally loose or sinful.¹⁷¹ By depicting these musical instruments in the panel of Hell, Bosch turns the tools of celebration into those of torture.

Being present in both music and the visuals of the artwork shows not only the relationship between the Italian and Northern Renaissances but also the relationship between the musical forms used at the time also being applied to the visual arts. After seeking these different relationships out, an even more interesting aspect of Bosch's unknown life is revealed in his opinion of the Renaissance and the changes that occurred during its transition from the Middle Ages.

¹⁷⁰ Silva Pilar Maroto, *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition*. (Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado, 2016): 33.

¹⁷¹ IBID, 105.

Conclusion

It is necessary to reiterate the argument made by Gombrich in his revisiting of the triptych wherein which the author urges viewers to look through a biblical scope when analyzing the work focusing mainly on the idea that the inside of the triptych chronologically directly predates the Flood with the outside of the triptych picturing the aftermath.¹⁷² It is not the contention of this paper to agree with this reading, but it is an interesting set of discourse to bring into the discussion when talking about Bosch's intention for the work. Knowing the patronage, as well as the artist's own place within society and his opinion of those below him leads to the conclusion that Bosch could easily have been making an argument for a regression back to Medieval ideals both in music and possibly art. As described by the Lowinsky text, changes were quickly occurring in musical practices introducing and popularizing instruments in devotional settings.¹⁷³

A very important aspect to this discussion is the timeline to which these changes are documented within contemporary sources. Lowinsky cites the popularization of nightly musical performances as early as 1483 in Antwerp, and tambourines used by Bosch's same confraternity in s'Hertogenbosch by 1531.¹⁷⁴ Placing Bosch's death at 1516, he would have seen firsthand not only the presence of nightly performances but the inclusion of instruments beginning to appear in Masses. It is the contention of this paper to make the claim that *The Garden of Earthly Delights*

¹⁷² E.H. Gombrich, "Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights: A Progress Report," *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32, no. 1 (1969): 163.

¹⁷³ Edward E. Lowinsky, "Music in the Culture of the Renaissance," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 15, no. 4 (1954): 513.

¹⁷⁴ IBID, 519.

is Bosch's way of expressing his fear for what he thought would become of the world if this transition from the Middle Ages to the Renaissance was to be successful. Again, bringing Gombrich's argument back, Bosch is likely using the story of the Flood and the events leading up to it to show that he faults music and folk celebrations as being the causation for a future catastrophe should it happen. The outside of the triptych as Gombrich argued can still be described as following the contents of the inner panels chronologically, however, citing the musical elements of the work as the causation the work acts as a warning against the practice of instrumentation in musical compositions within devotional settings. A court that is known to be poor at state building would find this type of work useful especially when visiting courts were allowed to view it as King Henry III or Englebert II could use it to warn others against the same perils presented by Bosch. It is complete conjecture but likely that the patron shared these same ideals, and with the commission of the work could show these ideals in a more subtle way to visitors when state building.

It requires a lot of time and research using several types of methodologies to understand the meaning of Bosch's *Garden of Earthly Delights*. Even when given all the time in the world, the true meaning still may never be confirmed. Because of this, the points made in this paper aim to give a unique reading of the work with the goal of adding to the expanding study but do not claim to be inarguable. Scholarship on this topic, paired with a musical analysis of the work, provides a series of conclusions about *The Garden of Earthly Delights* by Bosch. It can be said that the piece loosely depicts the Last Judgement, a scene familiar to the devotees of not only the church but courts as well. In addition to this, Bosch utilizes the public's recognition of the work as the Last Judgement in order to make a statement about what the artist deems as sinful or worthy of this judgement. Music plays an influential role in Bosch's distaste for ceremonies and

celebrations by pairing it with other morally loose subjects in the painting. Including musical compositions in the right panel is deliberate revealing a possible opinion shared by the artist. Bosch's life is often speculated about because there is so little that exists on the topic. What does exist are ledgers and first-hand documents that state facts about his purchases, estates, and membership of the religious confraternity, the Illustrious Brotherhood of Our Blessed Lady.

Looking at *The Garden of Earthly Delights* can be used as a source for Bosch's life as well as his opinion on specific social practices. The only music composition featured in the panel alongside sinners features forms from music found in both secular and devotional music. It is the inclusion of dissonance within polyphony that marks the work as a part of folk celebrations deeming it disapproved by the artist. A somewhat ironic twist to the work and the reason for its completion is that Bosch involuntarily highlighted how closely tied the two fields of music and art are. The forms that he used such as dissonance are used to create discomfort in the viewer but are used nonetheless and are arguably highly effective. He uses polyphony and multiple story lines as well as piles and piles of figures the same way music began to during the transition between the two art periods in question. If *The Garden of Earthly Delights* were meant to be a warning towards a stricter devotional era of music it is lucky that the artist passed on when he did for it is evident Bosch would have been utterly distraught by what was to come in the following decades and later centuries.

This paper aims to add to the hopefully expanding discourse on this topic, and shows that there are still more approaches to be taken with regard to this specific work of art. Because this painting has so many different elements and interpretations, the possibilities are arguably endless when it comes to what meaning may be garnered. The elusive life of Bosch has been mentioned many times throughout the discourse previously mentioned, but this does not make it irrelevant

or unnecessary to seek out and research. A revisitation of *The Garden of Earthly Delights* shows the close relationship amongst the fields of art, the various practices and forms that Bosch were akin to, as well as his negative opinion toward specifically those secular in nature. To be dramatic would be to claim that the triptych acts as a form of propaganda against the changes occurring during the transition between the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. Instead, this paper wishes to present evidence towards this argument and welcomes an ongoing debate to begin. As scholars before this discourse have mentioned a historian's work is never complete, and the author of this paper urges its peers to revisit elusive artists and artworks through different fields' lenses in the hopes that new meanings can be discovered.

Figures



Figure 1. Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights*. 1450-1516. Oil on oak. 205.5 x 384.9 cm. Museo del Prado, Madrid.



Figure 2. Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights Triptych* (closed). Oil on oak. 220 x 196 cm. Museo del Prado, Madrid.



Figure 3. Jan Van Eyck, *Crucifixion and Last Judgement* diptych, oil on canvas transferred from wood. 56.5 x 19.7 cm. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.



Figure 4. Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights* (detail).



Figure 5. Robert Campin. *Portrait of a Woman*, oil and egg tempera on panel, 1435, 40 x 27 cm.

National Gallery, London.



Figure 6. Giulio Quaglio the Younger, Ceiling in Ljubljana Cathedral, frescoes on plaster, 1703-1706, photographed by Petar Milosevic, 2015. Slovenia.



Figure 7. Hieronymus Bosch, *Garden of Earthly Delights* (detail).

Bibliography

Adams, Laurie Schneider. *Art and Psychoanalysis*. Westview Press, Boulder. 1994.

Barolsky, Paul. "The Interpretation of Art is Never Finished: Some Renaissance Examples,"
Arlon: A Journal of Humanities and the Classics Vol. 23, No. 2 (Fall 2015).

Barry, Peter. *Beginning Theory*. Manchester University Press. 2009.

Blondé, Bruno and Hans Vlieghe. "The Social Status of Hieronymus Bosch." *The Burlington Magazine* 131, no. 1039 (1989): 699-700.

Borenius, Tancred. "The Cycle of Images in the Palaces and Castles of Henry III." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 6 (1943): 40-50.

Bos, Jacques "Framing a New Mode of Historical Experience.: The Renaissance Historiography of Machiavelli and Guicciardini," In *the Making of the Humanities: Volume 1- Early Modern Europe* (Amsterdam University Press, 2010).

Bowe, Patrick. "The Garden of Eden: The Perspective of Garden History." *Garden History* 47, no. 1 (2019): 124–34. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26756811>.

Bowles, Edmund A. "Musical Instruments at the Medieval Banquet." *Revue Belge de*

Musicologie/Belgisch Tijdschrift Voor Muziekwetenschap 12, no. ¼ (1958): 41-51.

Brown, Howard Mayer. "Choral Music in the Renaissance." *Early Music* 6, no. 2 (1978).

Burkholder, J. Peter. "Music Theory and Musicology." *The Journal of Musicology* 2, no. 1 (1993): 11-23.

Colenbrander, Herman Th. "'In Promises Anyone Can Be Rich!' Jan van Eyck's Arnolfini Double Portrait: A 'Morgengave.'" *Zeitschrift Für Kunstgeschichte*, vol. 68, no. 3, 2005, pp. 413–24. JSTOR, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20474305>.

Crawford, Katherine B. "Love, Sodomy, and Scandal: Controlling the Sexual Reputation of Henry III." *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 12, no. 4 (2003): 513-42.

Cross, Ian. "Music Analysis and Music Perception." *Music Analysis* 17, no. 1 (1998): 3–20.

D'Alleva, Anne. *Methods and Theories of Art History*, 2nd ed. Laurence King, 2013.

Dixon, Laurinda S. "Bosch's Garden of Delights Triptych: Remnants of a 'Fossil' Science." *The Art Bulletin* 63, no. 1 (1981): 96–113.

Elders, Willem. "Humanism and Early-Renaissance Music: A Study of the Ceremonial Music by

Ciconia and Dufay.” *Tijdschrift van de Vereniging Voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis* 27, no. 2 (1977): 65–101.

Elhard, K. C. “Reopening the Book on Arcimboldo’s ‘Librarian.’” *Libraries & Culture* 40, no. 2 (2005): 115–27. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25541905>.

Eric, Cochrane, “Science and Humanism in the Italian Renaissance.” *The American Historical Review* 81, no. 5. (1976): 1039-57

Finke, Laurie A. “The Rhetoric of Desire in the Courtly Lyric.” in *Feminist Theory, Women’s Writing*, 29-74. Cornell University Press. 1992.

Fenlon, Ian. “Music and Domestic Devotion in the Age of Reform.” In *Domestic Devotions in Early Italy*, edited by Maya Corry, Marco Faini, and Alessia Meneghin (Brill, 2019).

Fuller, Richard “Renaissance Music (1450-1600)” GSCE Music Notes, at rpfuller.com

Gellrich, Jesse M. “The Semiology of Space in the Middle Ages: On Manuscript Painting, Sacred Architecture, Scholasticism, and Music.” in *The Idea of the Book in the Middle Ages: Language Theory, Mythology, and Fiction*, 51-93. Cornell University Press. 1985.

Giles, Roseen H, “The Inaudible Music of the Renaissance: From Marsilio Ficino to Robert Fludd,” *Renaissance and Reformation* Vol. 39, No. 2 (Spring 2016).

Glum, Peter. "Divine Judgment in Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 58, no. 1 (1976): 45–54.

Goehr, Lydia. "'All Art Constantly Aspires to the Condition of Music'—Except the Art of Music: Reviewing the Contest of the Sister Arts." In *The Insistence of Art: Aesthetic Philosophy After Early Modernity*, edited by Paul A. Kottman, 140–69. Fordham University Press, 2017.

Gombrich, E.H. "Bosch's 'Garden of Earthly Delights': A Progress Report." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 32 (1969): 162-70.

Gombrich, E.H. "The Earliest Description of Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delight." *Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes* 30 (1967): 403-406.

Haar, James. "Classicism and Mannerism in 16th-Century Music." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 25, no. 1/2 (1994): 5–18.

Healy, Margaret "The Body in Renaissance Studies," *Renaissance Studies* Vol. 25, No. 5 (November 2011).

Huck, Oliver. "The Music of the Angels in Fourteenth- and Early Fifteenth-Century Music." *Musica Disciplina* 53 (2003): 99–119. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/30249359>.

Ibanescu, Daniela-Corina “Aspects of Musical Life in Brasov-Barsa Land, Transylvania, During the Renaissance Period,” *International Multidisciplinary Scientific Conference on Social Sciences & Arts SGEM* no. 5 (2018).

Jones, Malcolm. “Folklore Motifs in Late Medieval Art III: Erotic Animal Imagery.” *Folklore* 102, no. 2 (1991): 192-219.

Kirnbauer, Martin. “‘Vieltönigkeit’ Instead of Microtonality: The Theory and Practice of Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century ‘Microtonal’ Music.” In *Experimental Affinities in Music*, edited by Paulo de Assis, 64–90. Leuven University Press, 2015.

Leach, Elizabeth Eva. “Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries,” *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015).

Leichtentritt, Hugo. “The Renaissance Attitude towards Music.” *The Musical Quarterly* 1, no. 4 (1915).

Leitch, Vincent B. *The Norton Anthology of Theory and Criticism*. Norton, W.W. & Company, Inc. 2018.

Lowinsky, Edward E. “Music in the Culture of the Renaissance.” *Journal of the History of Ideas* 15, no. 4 (1954): 509-53.

Luscinius, in Owens, "Music Historiography and the Definition of 'Renaissance,'" *Notes* 47, no. 2 (1990).

Macey, Patrick. "Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth, and Sixteenth Centuries," *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015).

Maroto, Pilar Silva. *Bosch: The 5th Centenary Exhibition*. Thames and Hudson, Museo Del Prado. 2016.

Mckinnon, James W. "Musical Instruments in Medieval Psalm Commentaries and Psalters." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 21, no. 1 (1968): 3-20.

Montagu, Jeremy. "Renaissance instruments". *The Oxford Companion to Music*, edited by Alison Latham. Oxford Music Online. Retrieved 1/28/2024.

Monfasani, John, "The Rise and Fall of Renaissance Italy," *Aevum* Vol. 89, No. 3 (Fall/Winter 2015).

Moray, Gerta. "Miró, Bosch and Fantasy Painting." *The Burlington Magazine* 113, no. 820 (1971).

Morganstern, Anne M. "The Rest of Bosch's Ship of Fools." *The Art Bulletin* 66, no. 2 (1984):

295-302.

Mulders, Esther. *The Green Middle Ages: The Depiction and Use of Plants in the Western World 600-1600*. Amsterdam University Press. 2022.

Oliver, Revilo P. "Recent Interpretations of the Renaissance," *Italica* 12, no. 2 (1935).

O' Malley, Michelle, "Quality Choices in the Production of Renaissance Art: Botticelli and Demand," *Renaissance Studies* Vol. 28, No. 1 (February 2014).

Osterwijk, Sophie. "This Worlde is But a Pilgrimage." in *Mental (Dis)Order in Later Medieval Europe* 197-218. Brill. 2014.

Owens, Jessie Ann. "Music Historiography and the Definition of 'Renaissance.'" *Notes* 47, no. 2 (1990).

Page, Christopher. "Biblical Instruments in Medieval Manuscript Illustration." *Early Music* 5, no. 3 (1977): 299-309.

Pestell, Richard. "Medieval Art and the Performance of Medieval Music." *Early Music* 15, no. 1 (1987): 57-68.

Petroski, Henry. *The Book on the Bookshelf*. New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1999.

Reutersward, Patrik. "A New Clue to Bosch's Garden of Earthly Delights." *The Art Bulletin* 64, no. 4 (1982): 636-38.

Rhodes, Rebekah. "Contemporary Adventures with The Garden of Earthly Delights: Open Worlds and Hieronymus Bosch." *Magazén* 4, no. 2 (2023): 329-356.

Rimmer, Joan. "Medieval Instrumental Dance Music." *Music & Letters* 72, no. 1 (1991): 61-68.

Rolfhamre, Robin. "The Language of Early Music Performance: A Proposition on How to Connect Words and Instrumental Music." *The Musical Times* 158, no. 1938 (2017): 81-92.

Rossi, Daniella. "Humanism and the Renaissance." *The Year's Work in Modern Language Studies* 69 (2007): 476-90. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25834052>.

Ruccius, Alexis. "The History of Musical Iconography and the Influence of Art History: Pictures as Sources and Interpreters of Musical History." In *The Making of the Humanities: Volume III: The Modern Humanities*, 403-12. Amsterdam University Press, 2014).

Saussure, Ferdinand de. *Course in General Linguistics*. McGraw-Hill Book Company. 1916.

Seidel, Linda "The Value of Verisimilitude in the Art of Jan Van Eyck." *Yale French Studies*,

1991.

Smoldon, W. L. "Medieval Church Drama and the Use of Musical Instruments." *The Musical Times* 103, no. 1438 (1962): 836-40.

Steen, Jasper van der. "The Nassaus and State Formation in pre-modern Germany." in *Dynasties and State Formation in Early Modern Europe, 165-86*. Amsterdam University Press. 2023.

Strezova, Anita "General Iconographic Changes in the 14th and 15th Centuries," in *Hesychasm and Art: The Appearance of New Iconographic Trends in Byzantine and Slavic Lands in the 14th and 15th Centuries* (Canberra: ANU Press, 2014).

Sullivan, Margaret A. "The Timely Art of Hieronymus Bosch: The Left Panel of 'The Garden of Earthly Delights.'" *Oud Holland* 127, no. 4 (2014): 165–94.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/24766228>.

Tabor, C.J. "The Troubadours." *Folklore* 40, no. 4 (1929): 345-68.

Thorndike, Lynn. "Elementary and Secondary Education in the Middle Ages." *Speculum* 15, no. 4. (1940): 400-408.

Tirro, Frank. "Music of the Renaissance." *The Musical Quarterly* 68, no. 2 (1982): 207–16.

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/742023>.

Treitler, Leo. "The Early History of Music Writing in the West." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35, no. 2 (1982): 237-79.

Turci-Escobar, John. "Keeping Up with the Words: Expressive Phrase Overlapping in the Late Italian Madrigal," *Music Analysis* 30, no. 2/3 (July-October 2011).

Van Orden, Kate. "Recent Trends in the Study of Music of the Fourteenth, Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries," *Renaissance Quarterly* Vol. 68, No. 1 (Spring 2015).

Westermann, Mariët. "After Iconography and Iconoclasm: Current Research in Netherlandish Art, 1566-1700." *The Art Bulletin* 84, no. 2 (2002): 351-72.

White, Hayden. "The Historical Text as Literary Artifact," *Clio* 3, no. 3. (June 1974).

Wright, L.M. "Misconceptions Concerning the Troubadours, Trouvères and Minstrels." *Music and Letters* 48, no. 1 (1967): 35-39.