

11-1-2011

Erica G. Polakoff and Ligaya Lindio-McGovern, (Eds.). Gender and Globalization: Patterns of Women's Resistance. Ontario, Canada: deSitter Publications. 2011.

Mantra Roy Ph.D.
University of Washington, Seattle, docmantra@gmail.com

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.lindenwood.edu/jigs>



Part of the [Anthropology Commons](#), [Critical and Cultural Studies Commons](#), [Environmental Studies Commons](#), and the [Sociology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Roy, Mantra Ph.D. (2011) "Erica G. Polakoff and Ligaya Lindio-McGovern, (Eds.). Gender and Globalization: Patterns of Women's Resistance. Ontario, Canada: deSitter Publications. 2011.," *Journal of International and Global Studies*: Vol. 3: No. 1, Article 25.

DOI: 10.62608/2158-0669.1085

Available at: <https://digitalcommons.lindenwood.edu/jigs/vol3/iss1/25>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at Digital Commons@Lindenwood University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of International and Global Studies by an authorized editor of Digital Commons@Lindenwood University. For more information, please contact phuffman@lindenwood.edu.

Erica G. Polakoff and Ligaya Lindio-McGovern, (Eds.). *Gender and Globalization: Patterns of Women's Resistance*. Ontario, Canada: deSitter Publications. 2011.

In the preface of this work, Erica G. Polakoff and Ligaya Lindio-McGovern articulate their purpose: to provide both a critical teaching tool in feminist approaches to globalization and a space for the articulation of voices of the silenced, gendered subalterns from within the matrix of capitalist neoliberal global policies. In the introduction, Polakoff defines key terms such as “global capitalist penetration” that help uninitiated readers engage with the concepts of globalization studies (3). Before conducting an overview of individual chapters, Polakoff traces the possible reasons informing the success of global capitalist penetration. She investigates the roles of the IMF, the World Bank, and ‘free trade’ agreements between the Global North and South in the context of (i) the South as cheap labor markets for the North, (ii) the North’s imposition of neoliberal policies on the South and the consequent “structural violence,” and (iii) the socio-cultural hierarchies of race, gender, and ethnicity that influence unequal income in transnational trades (9). Within this matrix, Polakoff situates women’s resistance (in the form of active organizing), which also empowers them. Polakoff concludes by emphasizing the shared vision of all the contributors: to achieve a more globally democratic world in which basic needs are met and women of all classes, races, and ethnicities can lead lives of dignity (24-25). Since the book is an avowed critique of globalization and its impact on women, I believe inclusion of some important counter-arguments defending globalization may have helped the editors further validate their argument.

Part I, “Neoliberal Policies, Migration and Women’s Resistance,” begins with Ligaya Lindio-McGovern’s “Neoliberal Globalization in the Philippines: Its Impact on Filipino Women and Their Forms of Resistance.” This chapter examines the complicity of the Philippine government in creating economic inequalities by embracing unfair trade policies initiated by the IMF. It also explains concepts like “economic liberalization,” “deregulation,” “privatization,” and “labor flexibilization” (34-41) and their roles in incapacitating the domestic economy through high trade deficits (35) and by reducing state-sanctioned subsidies (38-39). This detailed discussion, however, leaves the reader with crucial questions: what is the IMF’s “structural adjustment program,” which obligates the Philippine government to privatize health care (38), and why does the government adopt these policies? What needs more substantiation in the piece is the relationship between the privatization of amenities and the profits of transnational capitalists. The chapter ends with an overview of active resistances to the effects of globalization and government-sponsored military repression of the same. While Lindio-McGovern summarizes the work of the organizations GABRIELA, which raises national and international awareness about the impact of globalization on Filipino women (43) and Migrant International, which attacks the neoliberal policies adopted by both the domestic and labor-receiving governments, the chapter does not provide details of these organizations such as their founders, members, or charters. If militarization is indeed a response from the government, the chapter needs more statistics to substantiate this claim. Migrant International calls for a “new Philippine state” to end militarism and imperialism in the country (49). How this objective will be achieved is never addressed. Unfortunately, the chapter ends on a note of political revolution instead of a call for economic change.

In the second chapter, “We’re Better off Outside Our Country: Diasporic Ecuadorian Women in Spain since the Mid-1990s,” estheR Cuesta examines why Ecuadorian women,

compelled to migrate to Spain, where they encounter racism, sexism, and xenophobia, continue to choose their migratory status over living in Ecuador. Through detailed research and interviews with eight Ecuadorian women, Cuesta offers the reader a detailed overview of the contexts that inform the positions of Ecuadorian women in both countries: the personal motivations to migrate to Spain, the patterns of migrations, and the low self-esteem of Ecuadorians in Spain as a result of discrimination. In spite of her intriguing observations, there is no detailed discussion of the economic issues that may have led to the women's migrations, nor is there a substantial analysis of the neoliberal policies adopted in Ecuador and their effects, which effectively "failed" the people there (82). There is no articulation of what kinds of resistance the Ecuadorian women have embraced, a question that is particularly pertinent because this chapter is featured under the "Neoliberal Policies, Migration and Women's Resistance" section of the text.

Part II, "Women's Resistance and Capitalist Production for Export," begins with Judith Shaw's "The Employment Decisions of Female Garment Workers in Sri Lanka's Export Processing Zones." Following the introduction, this is the first strong chapter; it lays out details of Sri Lanka's experience with export-oriented garment production and its monopoly in employing rural women. Shaw links the growth of garment factories with the neoliberal policies that choked the rural economy. Shaw identifies 'push factors'—decreasing public investment in agriculture and increase in non-farming jobs, among others—that compelled rural populations to become low-paid employees in Export Processing Zones (EPZs). These migrations altered the status of women, who then had to assume jobs beyond their familial agricultural farms (102-105). In order to emphasize the monopoly of EPZs, Shaw also notes that state-run factories could not compete with EPZs because the state-run factories offered low wages and low job security. Secure in its position as the only choice for rural, unskilled populations, argues Shaw convincingly, EPZs then unleashed their own forms of exploitation, including long working hours and low wages (111), by prohibiting unions on the factories' premises (112) and by providing insufficient security for women employees in the EPZ-provided residences (114). In spite of several strengths of this chapter, the fact that the chapter does not mention "women's resistance" even once heavily undermines its strength. I believe the recurring problem lies not with the individual articles but in their misallocation to the sections of the anthology.

In the subsequent chapter, "Historical Consciousness and Collective Action: Finding Women's Resistance Where North Meets South," Mary E. Frederickson compares women's relocation to industrial occupations in the American South after World War I with the late 20th and early 21st century movements of women towards the "Global South" as parallel examples albeit they "divided by time and place" of the way in which capitalist productions accrue profits by choosing locations yielding cheap labor (121-122). However, her article is quite problematic on several counts. First, she clubs together several Global South countries, including Mexico, China, Vietnam, Guatemala, Haiti, as experiencing patriarchal oppression without distinguishing among the unique socio-cultural characteristics of each country (123). Secondly, she compares the situation of white American women in factories to that of women workers in the Global South, who, unlike the white women, find themselves on the wrong side of race, ethnicity, and nationality in the wider context of global capitalism. It appears that she deliberately overlooks these starkly different complexities informing each group of workers (124-125). Thirdly, Frederickson emphasizes the cross-class alliances in U.S. women's collaborations without referring to racial differences, which would have been impossible to ignore during the 1920s-1930s, the peak of Jim Crow South. The most striking feature of her article is the way she collapses the "US South" with the "Global South." In her optimism that North and South meet in

women's organizing against occupational exploitation, she forgets that industrialization in the US South has a very distinct history when compared to the circumstances in the Global South with respect to globalization.

Olga Sanmiguel-Valderrama's article, "Waves of Resistance in the Colombian Flower Industry (CFI)," operates as a much-needed corrective to the article that precedes it. She sets up the socio-historical-political context for the resistance movements that animated the flower industry in Colombia not only by discussing its domestic issues but also by locating Colombia's status in the world as a member of the Global South. The finest part of her article is the way she relates the domestic issues, resistances, achievements, and hindrances to the overall theme of the anthology—globalization and women's resistance—by highlighting the transnational connections and contributions, without ignoring the interstitial politics of race, ethnicity, and class. Justifiably, she insists on expanding the term "feminized [labor]" to "racialized feminized [labor]" in order to analyze the "poor [labor] standards that racialized low-income people have historically endured" (141). She cites parallel examples of the women of the South who find themselves in precarious employments both in the South and in the North as im/migrant workers, thereby recalling the articles about Ecuadorian women and Sri Lankan rural women workers. Sanmiguel-Valderrama offers critical details about the strategies adopted by the CFI women, their unionization, and the government's counter-strategy of establishing state-run unions. While her chapter tends to focus more on the repression of unionization by the state and calls for more discussion of successes and personal challenges faced by the workers, it nevertheless gives substantial details of specific organizations like Untraflores and its success with "collective agreement" (152). This essay concludes with the flower industry's transnational relations across the Global South and its work despite the state-sanctioned measures to control their work. This is so far the strongest chapter in the anthology.

Part III, "Alternative Trade Associations and Women's Resistance," begins with Jane Henrici's "Free Trade, Alternative Trade and Women in Peru: A First Look." Henrici examines the negative consequences of transnational 'free trade' on Alternative Trade Organizations (ATOs) in Peru, which are designed to help low-income women and their families. Henrici aptly acknowledges differences in class, race, and ethnic identity in her analysis of ATO's work with women. What is missing from her discussion of restrictions imposed by free trade and their effects is statistics (183-184). Moreover, her article begs the question: what are the consequences of trade agreements on women's lives? Except a brief mention of the "global gag rule" Henrici does not delve into the details of such consequences (184). While the primary thrust of the article involves the problems NGOs and ATOs encounter, a report on some achievements would have been a promising gesture. Henrici concludes her essay optimistically, suggesting that by developing "critical feminist scholarship" and "judicial support" to feminist groups in Peru, ATOs will make trade policies to assist women, their families, and communities (186).

In "Women's Rights and Collective Resistance: The Success Story of Marketplace India," Margaret A. McLaren argues successfully that "economic empowerment" alone can advance women's "rights and equality" by studying a cooperative organization, Marketplace/SHARE (191). Through a critical overview of feminist critiques of women's rights, McLaren is convinced that cooperatives offer a scope for collective empowerment and economic independence, in addition to political and social rights. Before discussing Marketplace's success, she sketches the background of women's poverty in India and cites examples of successful women's cooperatives such as the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh and SEWA (Self-Employed Women's association) in India. While providing details about Marketplace/SHARE's objectives

and projects, however, McLaren makes a curious observation: women use “traditions” in Marketplace, and that is why she is interested in examining it. While McLaren makes a fine case of economic empowerment of marginalized women in Mumbai, the emphasis on preservation of tradition as a reason for analysis is a little lame. This is because traditional arts in India are often inherited through caste and jati affiliations that help to preserve tradition; Gurcharan Das’ chapter on ‘caste’ in *India Unbound*, among other works, will be informative for the association between arts and castes. While this chapter clearly celebrates the achievements of a successful cooperative, it would have been instructive to know more details of the backgrounds of the women who are recruited, the recruiting process, and conflicts among the workers (especially because women with different languages, religions, and ethnic backgrounds may be working together). Nevertheless, McLaren offers strong evidence, through interviews, of the major achievements of Marketplace (202-204).

Part IV, “Responses to Poverty: Women’ and Children’s Resistance,” begins with Jeanine Anderson’s “Urban Poverty Reborn: A Gender and Generational Analysis,” which investigates the “transmission” of urban poverty from one generation to another in a poor neighborhood, Pamplona Alta, in Lima, Peru and demonstrates that poverty must be examined in “historical, political, social and cultural” terms (213). Her research, spanning 10-15 years, provides details of (1) the nature of urban poverty and the way in which it regenerates itself through the migration of rural poor to urban locations, (2) the development of “squatter settlements” and the living conditions therein, (3) the lack of good education for the poor children, and (4) the increase in criminal activities among city-born children as rural cultural backgrounds clash with urban lifestyles and initiates frustration and disillusionment. Then Anderson ties in second generation poverty with neoliberal policies adopted by the state, which further impoverish the young adults in terms of low wages, discrimination based on gender and ethnicity, and education levels. While the chapter provides many details about the cycle of poverty, it fails to discuss resistance movements among the city-born poor adults.

In the subsequent chapter, “Challenging Traditional Female Roles through Social Participation: Tensions in Women’s Experiences in Argentina’s Picketing Movements,” Ada Freytes Frey and Karina Crivelli examine the way women challenge stereotypes about themselves by gaining confidence from their participation in picketing movements. The authors provide a detailed commentary on the history and activities of picketing movements in Argentina, including both the movements’ achievements and challenges (posed by the government in the form of policies, divisions among the picketing organizations, and their final demobilization). The authors conduct interviews with four organizations that work closely with women workers and conclude that most women, despite their active participation in picketing, view themselves first as mothers and then as companions of their partners. However, the authors find, some women consciously reject the traditional roles assigned to them and assume the confidence and voice with which to engage with public officials in public spaces. Many of them earn from “‘social plans’ (subsidies)” that their active organizing achieved (244). While the authors are hopeful about female leadership, they acknowledge female leaders are too few in number when compared to their male counterparts. The authors propose as a solution the restructuring of thinking about sexual differences in society through educative meetings and discussions, as organized by Frente Popular Dario Santillan (FPDS) (252). Although the authors conclude with suggestions to restructure the national policies that demobilized picketing movements, they do not even attempt to relate these domestic policies or their motivations to globalization or trade policies, which the anthology focuses on.

In "The Feminization of Poverty in Post-Apartheid South Africa," Saranel Benjamin-Lemert introduces the socio-economic context of the end of Apartheid in South Africa, which initiated neoliberal economic policies and led to lack of amenities like water for the urban poor. The author then examines one of the first community struggles organized by urban, poor, black women who found themselves viciously trapped in poverty with the end of apartheid. The Bayview Flat Residents Association (BFRA), with only one male member, challenged the local municipality against "evictions, relocations, [and] water and electricity disconnections" (261). The women Benjamin-Lemert interviews argue that adoption of "austere" macro-economic neoliberal policies by the state has feminized poverty (262). This is because semi-skilled women were employed in textile, agriculture, and leather industries, which performed poorly due to lowered tariffs or subsidies and created unemployment (275). The women also argue that ANC's capital-driven neoliberal policies and internal hierarchies engendered corruption and aggravated poverty (267-273). Moreover, as Benjamin-Lemert aptly points out, the interstitial politics of race and class inform the resistance of these women to ANC's policies. The chapter ends on a positive note, explaining that many organizations are now demanding basic services from the government like the BFRA did. This is one of the strongest chapters in the anthology, and it effectively addresses women's impoverishment and resistance with respect to the Global South's engagement with globalization.

In the last chapter, "Global Capitalist Penetration, Child Labor and Children's Collective Resistance in Defense of Their Rights," Erica G. Polakoff makes the important arguments that (1) girl-children are exploited as cheap sexual-labor because of neoliberal policies adopted by different nation-states that exacerbate poverty, which in turn forces children to become income-earners and (2) child labor increases with a rise in household poverty (for which she offers much-needed empirical evidence). Then, Polakoff demonstrates how cheap labor markets in the Global South, like those of Haiti and China, offer lucrative locations for global capitalist penetration while destroying children's lives in these countries, as increased demand for labor sucks the children in. She then concentrates on sex-trafficking and the global movements of girls and young women to demonstrate the transnational reach of prostitution, as Third World female bodies are increasingly viewed as "new raw resources" (312). While Polakoff offers a detailed commentary on these transnational trends, a note on how the source-countries recruit girls would be helpful in understanding the deep roots of global prostitution. Polakoff concludes her chapter by naming children's organizations in Peru, New Delhi, Nicaragua, New York, and countries in Latin America that collectively resist the exploitation of girl children. It is indeed sobering when Polakoff concludes that "exploitation of children will not cease until the global economy is restructured to benefit the most marginalized communities and households, rather than global capitalist interests" (318).

In the conclusion, Ligaya Lindio-McGovern summarizes the main arguments made in the anthology and suggests changes in policies that the IMF and World Bank can adopt in order to rein in the global crisis unleashed by their capital-driven policies around the world. For example, "corporate stewardship" in tune with "communal stewardship" and "corporate citizenship" with concern for the lives of the labor force must be considered by these international financial institutions when providing "development loans" (337). Lindio-McGovern makes more crucial suggestions but does not propose ways to achieve them. For example, she says, movements led by the poor, peasants, and women must be "given a voice in policy formation," which is a laudable suggestion, but how this will be achieved is not addressed (338). Nevertheless, Lindio-McGovern concludes her chapter with important issues that need to be addressed in what she

rightly recognizes as an ongoing critical engagement with neoliberal globalization and women's resistance to it: research about how "local women's groups in Third World countries establish international solidarity networks" and examination of "epistemology and methodology" that will not "perpetuate the unequal structure of knowledge production between the global North and the global South" (340-341).

In spite of gaps in arguments and the need for secondary research in some articles, all authors offer critical evidence of subaltern women's experiences in the Global South under the sweeping neoliberal policies unleashed by globalization and international policy-bodies that choke their livelihoods and prevent healthy dignified living.

Mantra Roy, Ph.D.
University of Washington, Seattle
docmantra@gmail.com